Publishing since 1979

Central Asia

ISSN 1729-9552

ISSUE NO. 81 WINTER 2017

Journal of Area Study Centre
(Russia, China & Central Asia)
University of Peshawar
Peshawar - PAKISTAN

CENTRAL ASIA No. 81 Journal of Area Study Centre WINTER 2017

Publishing since 1979

Central Asia

ISSN 1729-9802

ISSUE NO. 81 **WINTER 2017**

Journal of Area Study Centre
(Russia, China & Central Asia)
University of Peshawar
Peshawar-PAKISTAN

CENTRAL ASIA

Biannual **No. 81** **Winter 2017**

Contents

1. October Revolution and Soviet Class Struggle Policy in Kyrgyzstan 1-11
Zuhra Altymyshova

2. Indian Opposition to Chinese Belt and Road Initiative: Response, Rationale and Action 13-34
Musarat Amin & Rizwan Naseer

3. World Trade Organization's Agreements Affecting Pak-Afghan Border Tribes 35-59
Noreen Naseer

4. Peshawar University Campus Libraries, Treasury of Central Asian Manuscripts 61-72
Abdul Haseeb & Saeed Ullah Jan

5. Conceptual Metaphors for Life in Pashto 73-88
Imran Khan & Shuja Ahmad

6. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) among the Managers of Flour Mills Industry in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa-Pakistan: Theory and Practice 89-102
Pervez Akhtar & Shahid Khan Kakakhel

Cover Image

Russian Revolution of October 1917

Political painting depicting address of the great revolutionary leader, founder of Russian Communist Party (Bolsheviks), a lawyer, an architect, builder, and first head (1917–24) of the Soviet state, Vladimir Ilich Ulyanov, known as Vladimir Ilich Lenin (1870-1924). The founder of the organization "Comintern (Communist International)" and the post death awarding source of "Leninism," the doctrine codified and conjoined with Karl Marx's works by Lenin's successors to form Marxism-Leninism, which became the Communist worldview.

Sources:

https://medium.com/@pplswar/dsas-jason-schulman-dead-wrong-on-lenin-the-bolsheviks-and-the-october-revolution-9ff02b1f5247

https://www.britannica.com/biography/Vladimir-Lenin

Tel.: +92 (0)91 9216764
Fax: +92 (0)91 9216661
E-mail: asc@uop.edu.pk
Websites : www.asc-centralasia.edu.pk
http://journals.uop.edu.pk

Central Asia Journal No. 81, Winter 2017

OCTOBER REVOLUTION AND SOVIET CLASS STRUGGLE POLICY IN KYRGYZSTAN

Zuhra Altymyshova*

Introduction

In the middle of the XIX century, the territory of contemporary Kyrgyzstan was conquered by the Tsarist Russia. Later, in 1917, as a result of the October Revolution, the Tsarist regime was replaced by the Soviet rule. In the territory of Kyrgyzstan, it was established firstly in the southern and western regions of the country, such as Suluktu and Kyzyl-Kiya, Osh and Talas, where the largest industrial enterprises, mines, railway junctions and most of the workers and soldiers were concentrated. However, already by the mid 1918, the Soviet government managed to spread its power to the entire region of Kyrgyzstan.

In 1924, the Turkestan Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic, established on April 30, 1918, was reorganized into a new administrative division. As the part of the Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic (RSFSR), on October 24, 1924 the Kara Kyrgyz Autonomous Region was formed. On May 25, 1925 the Kara Kyrgyz Autonomous Region was renamed into the Kyrgyz Autonomous Region. Then on February 01, 1926 it was restructured into the Kyrgyz Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic. On December 05, 1936 it became a separate constituent republic of the Union of the Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR) known as the Kyrgyz Soviet Socialist Republic. Along with other 15 Soviet Socialist states, Kyrgyzstan had been the member of the USSR for about 70 years, from 1919 till 1991.

The current paper focuses on the processes of social transformation under the Soviet regime, especially the implementation of class struggle policy and its impact on Kyrgyzstan. In comparison with the interventions from the Tsarist Russia, the social transformation process undertaken under the Soviet system was quite different. In the territory of the Kyrgyz traditional society, the Tsarist Russia made only some social reorganization, but the Soviets brought radical changes in to the socio-political organizations of the Kyrgyz people. The paper seeks to understand how the

* Presently serving as Assistant Professor, Department of History, Faculty of Letters Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University, Chingiz Aytmatov Campus, Bishkek/Kyrgyzstan.

Soviet Union tried to reconstruct the Kyrgyz society during the 1920s and 1930s. In addition, the paper will analyze the methods and mechanisms of the social transformation processes and the measures used by the Soviet government in their socio-political 'battles' against the local elites, and the influence of the new system on the existing socio-economic stratification in the context of the Kyrgyz society. During the Soviet period the prevalent scientific vision about the major historical events of the time was based on the Communist ideology. Therefore, the main aim of the paper is to analyze and describe an objective overview of the history of Soviet class struggle policy. The paper is based on the research of local archival documents, published sources and oral materials.

Class Struggle Policy in the Soviet Kyrgyzstan

It is claimed that the Soviet rule was rule of the working class people. The "rule of the class" and the "dialectics of class conflict" were the key concepts of the new regime. With the establishment of the Soviet power, a notion of "class struggle" had emerged and the idea of the elimination of upper class and the old order was disseminated. Every society had a ruling class (at least Bolsheviks believed so), and every ruling class had a potential challenger. The October Revolution introduced a new ruling class in to the Soviet society - the proletariat - the potential challenger of whom was the old ruling class.[1] The Bolshevist Cultural Revolution aimed to create a new man devoted to a new regime, denied the past life, and even rejected his kinship and religious relations. The New Soviet Person was supposed to privilege the interests of the socialist collective over personal bonds of kinship. The party sought to break the family ties of class enemies.[2] So, it can be claimed that the official history of the Soviet is primarily based on the class theory.

As for Central Asian region, it was important to the Bolsheviks both as a source for cotton and as the gateway to "the East," the territory where they planed to ignite the colonial revolution, which would undermine the rule of the bourgeoisie in Europe and usher the revolution. Yet, these plans of Bolsheviks had failed to materialize in the immediate aftermath of the October Revolution. But ultimately, social revolution required no justification, for it led to a higher stage in the evolutionary path that all humanity was destined to tread. The ends of Soviet rule - the building of

[1] Sheila Fitzpatrick, "The Construction of Social Identity in Soviet Russia." *The Journal of Modern History,* 65(4), (Chicago: The University of Chicago, Dec., 1993): 748-750

[2] Golfo Alexopoulos, "Stalin and the Politics of Kinship: Practices of Collective Punishment, 1920s-1940s."*Comparative Studies in Society and History,* 50(1), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, (Jan., 2008): 101-102

socialism and the achievement of a classless utopia - were common to all Soviet citizens.[3]

During Civil War (1917-1923) in October 1919 a special Commission for Turkestan Affairs was established. The members of commission arrived to Tashkent on November of the same year. Following the commission's recommendations, Moscow issued an action plan that focused on two main goals: elimination of colonialist attitudes among Russian settlers and of "feudal-patriarchal attitudes" among the Muslims. The land taken from the Kyrgyz after the suppression of the 1916 revolution was to be returned to its rightful owners. Landless peasants, regardless of nationality, were to be given land. To implement this policy, Russian settlers were to be disarmed. Speculators, former bourgeois, former tsarist policemen, and those among the old tsarist bureaucrats "who did not fit in the new Turkestan" were to be expelled or sent to the concentration camps in Russia.[4]

After the Civil War, the Soviet government started implementing its policies on transformation of the social structure of the Union and its consequent Republics. The major changes in the social sphere occurred in 1920-1930s. During this time period, the main goal of the Communist Party and the Soviet government was to build socialism in each and every aspect of a social life. One of the paradoxes of the Soviet system was that the project of destroying traditional society and the implementation of social engineering in order to create a new society.[5] Traditional society was considered as "*feudal and patriarchal*". In addition, the Soviet government propagated against Islamic dogma and practices as well as against the established traditions.

In Kyrgyzstan, traditional elites (*bai manaps* - economically and politically prevailing category) were considered as *"class enemies", "exploiters",* and they targeted for social transformation in 1920-1930. The word "*bai*" in the Kyrgyz language means not only *rich* but also refers to a person who possesses capital and lives prosperously. The word *manap* refers to that category of people who ruled the Kyrgyz before the Soviet period, the so-called leaders of the nation. The Russian Empire had been relying on the local *manaps* in the government of the region. Generally, most of the *manaps* were tribal leaders. They managed political and economic issues in

---

[3] Adeeb Khalid, "Backwardness and the Quest for Civilization: Early Soviet Central Asia in Comparative Perspective." *Slavic Review*,65(2), (Pittsburgh: Association for Slavic, East European and Eurasian Studies, Summer 2006): 237-238

[4] Michael Rywkin, *Moscow's Muslim Challenge: Soviet Central Asia.* (New York: M.E.Sharpe Inc., 1990): 27-28

[5] Olivier Roy, *The New Central Asia. The Creation of Nations.* (New York: New York University Press, 2000):85

the region and performed the role of the judge. All manaps were accountable before the head of tribal consolidation in the Northern part Kyrgyzstan.

According to the famous ethnographer S.M. Abramzon, after the establishment of the Russian Tsarist power, the capitalist relations started to emerge in the economic life of the Kyrgyz nomadic people, which led to the emergence of new types of *manaps*, such as merchants, owners of production and capitalist manaps. S.M. Abramzon indicates that very literate people were *manaps* till 1930 and most of them worked as a teacher (also before the October Revolution preferably children of bai-manaps were getting education in school). Between 1920-1930 there were some *manaps* who worked in Soviet government bodies together with communists. Besides, at that time in local press there were discussions whether or not *manaps* could take Soviet posts.[6] According to some unverified sources, in 1925 in Kyrgyzstan there were more than 4 thousands *manaps*, whereas the number of *bais* was much higher. [7]

The Kyrgyz District Committee of CPSU (b) issued the arrangement, which provided the conceptual explanation of the class categories existing in the society during that time. According to that arrangement, *"Manap-as an economic unit is not powerful, but as a political figure has great influence. Bai is an economically strong pastoralist-landowner, who has from 200 or more rams, 35 or more heads of cattle. The middle peasant has from 20 to 200 rams and from 3 to 35 head of cattle; poor man-20-25 rams, 3-4 heads of cattle; hired worker (batrak), works like a shepherd or domestic servant an annual earnings of 50 rubles or 6 rams".* [8]

The policy of class differentiation was implemented from the beginning of the Soviet rule. The Communist party in the Central Asia was responsible for carrying out the current policy of class differentiation among local dwellers. At first, it was necessary to find upper class among people so that they could fight against them according to the logic of the October Revolution. The terms "class" or "fighting against the class" weren't clear for the majority of Kyrgyz people, since most of the villages functioned as a whole organism. Regardless of the fact that the process of class differentiation of villages was slow, the Party nevertheless realized its goals mostly thanks to the propaganda carried out during and after the revolution.[9]

---

[6] Saul Abramzon, "Sovremennoe Manapstvo v Kirgizii." *Sovetskaya Etnographia,* no. 3-4, (1931): 44-54

[7] Joldoshbek Malabaev, *Borba Kirgizskoy Partorganizatsii za Ukrepleniye Sovetov.* (Frunze: 1962): 35

[8] The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 10, list. 1, file. 128, 40-42.

[9] Ishengul Boljurova, "Vostok Delo Tonkoe; Pravda o Manapah." newspaper *Respublica.* Bishkek: no.39, 1992.

As thought by the Bolsheviks, modernity meant to replace the more "backward" forms, such as the clannish, tribal or feudal systems identifiable across the former Russian Empire. Lineages were one of the traits of backwardness that Sovietization sought to eliminate. Soviet modernization sought to eradicate lineage relations in order to build a new society freed from the so-called old relations.[10] The Soviet government implemented certain programmes against lineage and kin relations in the territory of Kyrgyzstan as well. Those programmes were primarily carried against *bai-manaps* who possessed the power and could influence on the local people, the kolkhozes as well as the local Soviet apparatuses.

The Soviet government aimed to destroy the lineage relations and to liquidate village soviets and kolkhozes, the representatives of which were usually from the same tribe. During the election periods to the local village soviets, the Kyrgyz tribe representatives often had conflicts over who would get the power. In his speech in 1925, I. Zelenskii, the secretary of the Party's Central Asia Bureau, emphasized that in most of the parts of Kyrgyzstan the power of tribes and tribal leaders (*manaps*) are 10 times stronger than the power of the Soviet government. So, he stressed on weakening the power of tribal leaders and strengthening the power of the Soviets.[11]

Despite the Communist Party's strong efforts to destroy kinship ties, the power and the influence of the tribal structure had been saved in the region. The chairmen of the village soviets had been elected from the strongest tribes. In 1920s, the main decision-makers in regard to the Soviet affairs were still the councils of *aksakals* (elders) in local villages. Respect towards *aksakals* and bai-manaps continued. The spread of the revolutionary ideas and practices to the region, therefore, remained a central goal of the Kyrgyz party organization throughout the late 1920s. The first stage of that effort consisted of eliminating the influence of traditional elites.[12] In 1926, a special commission on combating *manaps* was organized.

Measures of the Soviet Government against Local Elites and the Process of Their Implementation

In the early Soviet years, political and economic restrictions had been applied toward wealthy people, clergy, and merchants. They were deprived of the right to vote in elections to the Soviets councils. They were obliged to

[10]Isabelle Ohayon, "The Soviet State and Lineage Societies: Doctrine, Local Interactions, and Political Hybridization in Kazakhstan and Kirghizia During the 1920s and 1930s." *Central Asian Affairs*, 3-2016, (Brill, 164): 173

[11]Joldoshbek Malabaev, *Ukreplenie Sovetov Kirgizii v Period Stroitelstva Sotsializma.* (Frunze: 1969): 332

[12]Benjamin Loring, "Rural Dynamics and Peasant Resistance in Southern Kyrgyzstan, 1929-1930." *Cahiers Du Monde Russe ,* 2008/1, (vol. 49), (Paris) : 195-196

carry out different works (*state norms*) in agriculture and livestock farming. In comparison with other social groups, they were taxed at a higher rate. They were presented in negative ways, poor people, *batraks* (hired workers) and middle peasants were agitated against these groups of people.

The deportation of the local *bai-manaps* to other republics of the Soviet Union was one of the methods to eliminate their influence on the social lives of people as well as on the Soviet apparatuses in Kyrgyzstan. Deportation was aimed at strengthening Sovietization by elimination of public, political, economic and tribal influences of the well-of category not only ordinary people but also to local Soviet apparatuses in Kyrgyzstan. In 1927, 21 and in 1929, 44 *bai-manaps* from Soviet Kyrgyzstan were deported to Russia. Since they were regarded as an obstacle to such processes as Sovietization, collectivization of the village, cultural and economic progress of the republic, the Soviet government tried to decrease the presence of their political, economic and social influences in the region by all possible means. They were accused of participation in the anti-Soviet Basmachi Movement[13] as well as of exploiting people and carrying out anti-Soviet propaganda and organizers of tribal fighting.[14]

In collectivizing the countryside, the Communist Party purged it of the kulaks (rich peasants) branded as "class enemies" (rural bourgeois) and their supporters. The word *"kulak",* used as a political term between 1920-1930, meant a prosperous peasant who exploits people. In general, everybody who was against for collectivization was regarded as a *"kulak".* It is important to note that kulaks experienced the process of *dekulakization* during the mass collectivization years, the process that was directly related to class struggle policy. Dekulakization was a repressive political campaign carried out in villages, which included such practices as confiscation of private property, arrests and deportations of the well-off peasants and their families to remote regions. The stated purpose of the campaign was to fight the counter-revolution and build socialism in the countryside.

In Kyrgyzstan, *bai-manaps* were also labeled as *"kulaks"* and were considered as the main target group for dekulakization. In 1928 V.Shchubrikov, the secretary of the The Kyrgyz District Committee of CPSU (b), underlined that *"kulaks in Kyrgyzstan were more dangerous than in other regions of the Soviet Union, because they mostly originated from*

[13]One main reason for the existence of the Basmachi Movement to the Bolsheviks was an attempt to deep the restruction of the Muslim society by Soviet regime. The Basmachi Movement continued from 1918 until 1934 in Central Asia. See Martha B. Olcott, "The Basmachi or Freemen's Revolt in Turkestan 1918-24." *Soviet Studies,* vol. XXXIII, no. 3, Taylor & Francis, Ltd., 1981, 352.

[14]The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 10, list. 1, file. 97, 122-123; The Central State Archive of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 21, list.15, file. 39, 105, 238; The Osh District State Archive, fund. 1, list.1, file.192, 309-318.

manaps."[15] But in fact, in Kyrgyzstan, there were not many kulaks. According to the fiscal accounting, in 1928-1929 there were 3, 406 farms in Kyrgyzstan, which belonged to kulaks, representing only 1.8% of the total number of farms. However, the order about the dekulakization required the elimination of at least 3% of peasant farms. It was mandatory to carry out this process in all areas without any specific analysis of the social structure of farms[16].

The state policy on "eradication of the kulaks as a class" especially was strengthened during the forced collectivization of agriculture. On June 29, 1931 the Central Asian Bureau of the Central Committee CPSU (b) confirmed and sent the directive to regions «About deportation of kulak's families», and on July 21, 1931 they sent instruction on deportation processes to the Kyrgyz District Committee of CPSU (b). According to the instruction of Central Asian Bureau of the Central Committee of the Communist Party, in 1931 700 families were exiled from the northern Kyrgyzstan to Ukraine. The next deportation campaign was implemented in 1932, during which 500 kulaks' farms were displaced from the South of Kyrgyzstan to other regions of the USSR.[17]

Special republican and regional commissions were organized for carrying out of the process of deportations of "anti-Soviet elements." These processes were accompanied with widespread governmental agitation activities among the local population against *bai-manaps*. Regardless of this, the analyses of the archival documents show that the ordinary people did not take active part in the campaign work. On the contrary, they demanded to release the arrested people. For example in 1929, in the village Bel-Ayil located in Osh district, when Chokobay Sasyev was arrested, the villagers wanted him to be released. They said «either you will release Sasyev or you will arrest all of us. »[18] In some place deportation campaign of ordinary people was regarded as damage for tribes.[19] Even there are facts about some local Soviet workers defended arrested people. In order to change the local people's attitudes towards the deportation processes, the Soviet government undertook some measures such as handing out properties of deported people to the poor. However, such kind of attempts did not bring any results.

---

[15] Djumadyl Baktygulov, "Kollektivzatsiya Kirgizskogo Aila: Noviy Vzglyad." *Kommunist Kirgizstana*, no 3, (Frunze: 1990): 86

[16] Jenish Junushaliev, *Vremya Sozidaniya i Tragediy 20-30 Gody XX v.* (Bishkek: Ilim, 2008): 157-158

[17] The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 10, list. 1, file.363, 72-76.

[18] *Sovetskaya Kirgizia*, (Frunze, 17 October 1929), No. 237

[19] The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 10, list. 1, file.201, 29.

Generally the instructions of the Communist Party on dekulakization were implemented against the laws of the local authorities. The government orders and documents related to the dekulakization were not kept not because of political and economic reason, but mainly because of such factors as resentment and tribal relationship. Some people were deported confiscated and deported because they were the others' opponent or because of their belongingness to certain tribes. People holding different Soviet state posts were also exposed to deportation. The number of deported kulaks was higher in some places. For instance, in 1931 according to the order from the center, 25 families had to be exiled from Jety-Oguz region. But *troyka* (special commission) decided to deport five additional families, so the total number of deported families had been increased to 30.[20] Different factors like personal hostility, mutual relations, squaring of accounts played important role in determining kulaks.[21] Ayish Akebay Kyzy who was deported to the Ukraine and lived there until 1937, informed that her father was only middle peasant. Her elder sister married to a man whom she did not love. Soon she declared that she would not live with her husband and came back to father's home. Then brother of her husband who worked as a local Soviet ruler accused the bride's father as a kulak and all family members were forced to exile to Ukraine.[22] Thus, not only wealthy category, but also middle class, sometimes even poor people suffered from the dekulakization.

Forced collectivization, class struggle policy and dekulakization campaign led to protests and onset the emigration processes to China, at certain places they also revitalized the Basmachi Movement in Kyrgyzstan at the end of 1920s - at the beginning of 1930s.[23] Also, the above-mentioned transformation processes (the collectivization, industrialization, dekulakization carried out during 1920s and 1930s) had negatively reflected on demographic growth of Kyrgyz people.[24]

At the same time, the Soviet government solved its economic problem at the expense of stocks and properties confiscated from deported people. The properties of *bai-manaps* and kulaks confiscated by the Soviet government were utilized as the main stocks of kolkhozes in Kyrgyzstan. For example, to realize the plans of collectivization in 1927, 12 *artel*s[25] for cattle breeding and agriculture were founded in the regions where deported *bay-manaps*

---

[20] The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund.10, list.1, file.363, 87.

[21] Akylbek Jumanaliev, *Politicheskaya Istoriya Kyrgyzstana,* (Bishkek: 2005): 251

[22] Ayish Akebay Kyzy, was born in 1923, date and place of interview: 2015, Bishkek.

[23] The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 10, list. 1,file. 281, 20, 114; The Osh District State Archive, fund. 79, list.1, file.14, 63-67.

[24] Shayir Batyrbayeva, *Epoha Stalinizma v Kyrgyzstane v Chelovecheskom Izmerenii*, (Moscow: Rossiyskaya Politicheskaya Entsiklopedia, 2010): 52

[25] *Artel* - is a general term for various cooperative associations. (From en.wikipedia.org)

lived before.[26] In 1929, 48 kolkhozes were organized based on confiscated property of the deportees.[27] Confiscated houses were transformed into Soviet socio-cultural offices.

Conclusion

The history of Kyrgyzstan during the Soviet times is one of the significant periods of the Kyrgyz historiography. And the official Soviet historiography emphasized that the Great October Revolution provided the local people with freedom, created adequate conditions for the elimination of economic and cultural backwardness and most importantly saved them from the exploitation practices carried out by local *bai-manaps*. It stated that the October Revolution and the establishment of the proletariat dictatorship opened the way for the Kyrgyz people to move from the feudal-patriarchal system to socialism bypassing the stage of capitalism. But Soviet class struggle policy and social transformation in 1920-1930s also brought negative consequences for Kyrgyzstan. Through dekulakization, the destruction of the traditional elites in the Kyrgyz society took place. Most of the deportees lost their parents and close relatives in the exile. Even today, the contemporary generation does not know what happened to their deported grandparents. The analyses of the oral materials illustrate that deportee's children were subjected to discrimination. They had many obstacles while entering the university, during the employment procedures, had hardships if they wanted to become members of Komsomol, Communist party, and also hardly could get high Soviet positions. Due to these obstacles some of those people even had to hide their origin and change their surnames.

The purges of *"class enemies"* from Soviet party apparatus and kolkhozes occurred from time to time. Soviet government used and relied on the poor people against *bai-manaps*. The poor were appointed to managerial positions despite the lack of education and working experience. All Soviet institutions practiced class discrimination, giving preference to the poor people. So, the human resource policies during the Soviet Kyrgyzstan were implemented based on class struggle framework primarily.

I argue that the class struggle and Soviet social transformation policies carried out in 1920-1930s in the territory of Kyrgyzstan were conducted in a radical way. Social reorganizations were realized alongside with economic transformations. At the end of the 1920s and beginning of the 1930s forced collectivization and sedentarization were launched. Consequently, the Kyrgyz nation joined to collective farms, proceeded to a settled way of life

[26] The Central State Archive of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 21, list.15, file. 39, 115-116.
[27] Joldoshbek Malabaev, *Ukreplenie Sovetov Kirgizii v Period Stroitelstva Sotsializma.* (Frunze: 1969): 187

and began to work in the Soviet industry to fulfill the industrialization program of the socialist system. Thus in the 1920-1930's, the socio-political system of the local population of Kyrgyzstan has fundamentally changed. As a result such strata as party bureaucrats, Soviet intelligentsia, workers, and peasants emerged in the Kyrgyz society. Obviously Moscow centered government actively intervened in to the local social structures of the Kyrgyz and created new Soviet cadres from young educated generation.

Bibliography

Archive documents

The Central State Archive of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 21, list.15, file. 39,
The Central State Archive of Political Documents of The Kyrgyz Republic, fund. 10, list. 1, file. 97, file. 128, file.201, file. 281, file.363.
The Osh District State Archive, fund. 1, list.1, file.192; fund. 79, list.1, file.14.

Books and Periodical Publications

Abramzon, S. "Sovremennoe Manapstvo v Kirgizii." *Sovetskaya Etnographia*, no. 3-4, 1931

Alexopoulos, G. "Stalin and the Politics of Kinship: Practices of Collective Punishment, 1920s-1940s." *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 50(1), 2008

Baktygulov, J. "Kollektivzatsiya Kirgizskogo Aila: Noviy Vzglyad." *Kommunist Kirgizstana*, no. 3, 1990

Batyrbayeva, Sh. *Epoha Stalinizma v Kyrgyzstane v Chelovecheskom Izmerenii*. Moscow: Rossiyskaya Politicheskaya Entsiklopedia.

Boljurova, I. "Vostok Delo Tonkoe; Pravda o Manapah." newspaper *Respublica.* Bishkek, 1992

Fitzpatrick, Sh. "The Construction of Social Identity in Soviet Russia." *The Journal of Modern History*, 65(4), 1993

Jumanaliev, A. *Politicheskaya Istoriya Kyrgyzstana.* Bishkek.

Junushaliev, J. *Vremya Sozidaniya i Tragediy 20-30 Gody XX v.* Bishkek: Ilim, 2008

Khalid, A. "Backwardness and the Quest for Civilization: Early Soviet Central Asia in Comparative Perspective." *Slavic Review*, 65(2), 2006

Loring, B. "Rural Dynamics and Peasant Resistance in Southern Kyrgyzstan, 1929-1930." *Cahiers Du Monde Russe* , 2008/1, vol. 49, 2008

Malabaev, J. *Borba Kirgizskoy Partorganizatsii za Ukrepleniye Sovetov. Frunze*, 1962

Malabaev, J. *Ukreplenie Sovetov Kirgizii v Period Stroitelstva Sotsializma.* Frunze, 1962

Ohayon, I. "The Soviet State and Lineage Societies: Doctrine, Local Interactions, and Political Hybridization in Kazakhstan and Kirghizia during the 1920s and 1930s." *Central Asian Affairs*, 3, 2008

Olcott, M. B. "The Basmachi or Freemen's Revolt in Turkestan 1918-24." *Soviet Studies,* XXXII(3), 1981

Resnick, S.A., & Wolff, R.D. *Class Theory and History: Capitalism and Communism in the USSR*, New York: Routledge, 2002

Roy, O. *The New Central Asia. The Creation of Nations.* New York: New York University Press, 2000

Rywkin, M. *Moscow's Muslim Challenge: Soviet Central Asia.* New York: M.E.Sharpe Inc., 1990

Sovetskaya Kirgizia., Frunze, October 1929

Central Asia Journal No. 81, Winter 2017

INDIAN OPPOSITION TO CHINESE BELT AND ROAD INITIATIVE: RESPONSE, RATIONALE AND ACTION

Musarat Amin [*] ***& Rizwan Naseer*** [**]

Abstract

China's massive initiative of the Belt and Road (BRI) is a gigantic leap that is aiming to connect world's 65% population, 30% of global G.D.P and about sixty eight countries that have signed on to be part of this mega project. The China Development Bank has estimated 900 projects that are worth more than a trillion dollars, underway to accomplish dream of 21st century New Silk Road. China-Pakistan Economic Corridor is the flagship project of BRI, heralded as game changer that will bring prosperity to Pakistan and will turn Gwadar into an economic hub between Africa, West-Asia and South Asia. India opposed China's BRI as well as CPEC to neutralize China's regional and global influence. Modi has shifted from India's Look East to Act-East Policy and introduced Mausam and SAGAR projects to counterweight BRI. This paper unfolds reasons of India opposition to BRI as well CPEC by providing readers insights about various Indian foreign policy goals. This paper is an analysis of China's BRI and India's response to contain it. It also highlights the challenges that CPEC is facing due to India intensive diplomatic maneuvers to impede it. The BRI is set to transform China from civilization state to a western style nation state.

Key Words: Belt and Road Initiative, CPEC, Regional Connectivity, Indian Opposition

Theorizing India's Foreign Policy towards China: Debates and Perceptions

India's foreign policy had a great shift after cold war from the member of Non Aligned Movement (NAM) to a proactive Asian balancer against rising China. It also became important for the United States and

[*] Assistant Professor Department of Defence and Diplomatic Studies, Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi. Email: drmusarat@fjwu.edu.pk

[**] Assistant Professor of International Relations Department of Humanities COMSATS University Islamabad Email: rizwan.naseer@comsats.edu.pk

other great powers after assuming nuclear power status and a market economy. Along the "Belt and Road", India is an important country given its strategic location and potential market value. India's ambition to dominate Indian Ocean region is deep-rooted and all political parties in India including ruling elite and opposition parties agree on this foreign policy goal.

China's Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) in Indian Ocean also poses greater challenge to Indian ambition of dominating the region. Therefore, Indian policy makers and strategists favour staying out of BRI despite China's invitation and safeguard major power status in Indian Ocean region. India also wants to boost its industrialization and infrastructure projects with the assistance from other developed countries. Indian policy makers are also sanguine that they can attract massive investment from Chinese enterprise without involving in BRI. Modi's government is more proactive and assertive to compete with China for seeking a great power status.[1] Harsh V. Pant states that states respond to their structural conditions and put their utmost efforts to counter the most prominent challenges to their security. He further claims that Indian foreign policy seems to have been unable to make a coherent response to China's rise because the rise of latter undermines India's interests in many ways.[2] According to Hoffman the mainstream perspectives if Indians view China as a potential threat to their security but also hope that effective Indian diplomacy can allay major conflict in future.[3] China's burgeoning strategic ties with India's neighbouring countries are a subject of concern for India. China's politico-economic involvement in Bangladesh, Nepal, Sri Lanka, Myanmar and Afghanistan with military dimensions added into interaction, worries India. New Delhi is watchful of China's increasing interests in Indian Ocean after implementation of the BRI. Some commentators who take a hawkish stance are not convinced with China's seemingly benign policies in India's backyard (Indian Ocean). India is also concerned about its competition with China for accessing markets and achieving resources globally.[4] C. Raja Mohan states that India is on the verge of becoming a great power. World has witnessed when George W. Bush then President of the United States clinched Nuclear Deal with India in July,2005.He claims that India is emerging as a swing state in the global balance of power paradigm. It will have the potential to shape the outcome of most critical issues of twenty-first

---

[1] Ye, H, India's Policy Towards China Under the Mindset of "Assertive Government". In *Annual Report on the Development of the Indian Ocean Region 2015*. (Springer: Singapore, 2016): 40

[2] Pant, H. V. "Indian foreign policy and China". *Strategic Analysis*, *30*(4), (2006): 760-780

[3] Ibid.

[4] Madan, T. India's relations with China: the good, the bad and the (potentially) ugly. *Brookings Institute Series: Brookings East Asia Commentary*, (72), (2013)

century including Asian stability, political modernization of Middle East and effective management of globalization.[5]

There are plenty of scholars who debate about India's foreign policy but the most common point that emerges most of the discussions is that India is determined to give tough time to China in Asian Affairs in particular and world in general. Indian foreign policy is more of Sino-Pakistan centric and therefore any venture by China will be met with fierce resistance from India. This paper highlights India's opposition to China's BRI and its flagship project i.e. China-Pakistan Economic Corridor. Indian countermeasures to neutralize the influence of BRI and diplomatic maneuvers are aimed at keeping a quasi balance with China. This paper goes along the three concepts of China and India's respective foreign policies i.e. (i) Rational (ii) Response and (iii) Action

Rationale of the BRI

History of Silk Road dates back to Han dynasty about 130 B.C. Trading posts along the loose skein of thoroughfares from the Greco-Roman metropolis across Syrian Desert, modern-day Iraq and Iran to the former Chinese capital of Xian. China's Silk Road streamlined transportation of grain, livestock, medicine and science. To reincarnate China's leading role in contemporary times, Dean of Peking University's School of International Studies proposed China's pivot to westward into Eurasian landmass which later on became state policy in 2013.[6]

To rejuvenate the very concept of Silk Road, China's President Xj Jinping in 2013 announced that old Silk Road would get another birth in the form of Belt and Road Initiative.[7] What makes difference is the ultimate outcome of Belt and Road Initiative (BRI). Rationale of China's leadership behind the most ambitious infrastructure project worth more than a trillion dollars, is to connect China with world's sixty five per cent population and thirty per cent of global G.D.P. To reap the fruits of this venture sixty-eight countries have signed on and more are likely to add up.

Indian Ocean links Asian and European strategic space and is also vital as Sea Lines of Communication (SLOC) pass through and about 80 % of world's seaborne trade passes through choke points in Indian Ocean. Therefore, major regional and extra-regional powers maintain their naval

[5] Mohan, C. R. "India and the Balance of Power." *Foreign Affairs*. (2006).
[6] Lim, Alvin Cheng-Hin. "The Moving Border of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor." *Geopolitics* (2017): 4-5
[7] Monteleone Davide. "A New Silk Road". *The New Yorker*, (18/12/2018). Retrieved from https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2018/01/08/a-new-silk-road

presence in this region. The United States has stationed fifth fleet in these waters couple with other allied strategic bases in the region. Other former colonial power including Britain and France also maintained their presence in the region beyond colonial era and NATO countries reached cooperative agreements with West Asian countries to leverage in naval power.[8]

The Belt and Road Initiative runs through the continents of Asia, Africa and Europe which also connects vibrant economies of East Asia and developed European economies on the other end. After completion of this trillion dollars project, China may come into extensive trade linkage with Central Asia, Russia, Europe, Persian Gulf, West Asia, South Asia, Southeast Asia and Mediterranean Sea.[9] Such an immensely rich economic corridor is going to turn the table on China's might and it may establish a network of natural allies and trade partners which may avert and menace to China's rise to global centre-stage.

Apart from economic triumph this diplomatic maneuver of China is going to make difference in China's diplomatic power. China's foreign policy's already crafted five principles of peaceful co-existence would push this strategically-economic venture into right direction. By reincarnating those principles of co-existence China may develop an environ of mutual respect for each other's sovereignty, territorial integrity, mutual non-aggression and mutual non-interference in each other's affairs, equality and mutual benefit to generate peaceful co-existence with partner and non-partner state of the BRI.[10] History reveals that international politics has brutal to even benign plans.

India and China are considered contenders for regional and global influence as India is vying to catch up with China in international arena. History of Sino-Indian ties has been full of tensions and turbulence but before 1962, relations between both of the neighbours were fairly warm because of the post-colonial bonhomie and concept of Asian Solidarity. Famous Hindi phrase during the time of first Indian Prime Minister Jawaharlal Nehru, "*Hindi-Chini Bhai-Bhai"* (Indian and Chinese are brothers) envisioned a new socialist Asia. China and India were locked into fierce dispute over Aksai Chin and Arunachal Pradesh (South Tibet) along their shared border. China administered Aksai Chin, through which ran the main route between Xinjiang and Tibet has undoubtedly been of enormous strategic significance

[8] Srivastava, N. "Prospects for Russia–India Relations in the Indian Ocean Region". *Maritime Affairs: Journal of the National Maritime Foundation of India*, *13*(1), (2017): 82

[9] Swaine, M. D. Chinese views and commentary on the 'One Belt, One Road'initiative. *China Leadership Monitor*, *47*(2), (2015): 3

[10] Ibid.3

to China. Therefore, China was not flexible over territorial integrity of China. As both the players made strands in international politics, they adhered to more rational approach of focusing on the convergence of strategic and economic interests and avoid any escalation that can endanger regional stability on one hand and may seriously impede bilateral ties.

The author of "*When China Rules the World: The End of Western World and Birth of a New Global Order*" Jacques Martin pens that China's strategic designs are not to run the global system because it already believes itself as centre of the world. China views itself as playing natural role in world affairs. Jacques differentiates between China as a 'civilization state' and western styled nation-state. He opines about China's natural stimulating comparison with India because both being world's leading populations have resulted in underlying lack of empathy and understanding. World perceived China's military buildup as a potential threat to regional and global competitors whereas it is aimed at averting any possible Taiwanese move towards independence rather than achieving global domination. If China really aspires to seek global hegemony then the relative technological level should drastically rise whereas it remains relatively low.[11]

India in recent times provoked China by using rhetoric to curtail China's influence in South Asia and global affairs. China's rise to global centre-stage is mainly because of Chinese enterprise and its understanding towards worth of trade and commerce. China's commercial venture by establishing facilities and ports along sea lines of communication in Indian Ocean is better known as 'Strings of Pearl'. The term 'String of Pearls' was first used in a report "*Energy Futures in Asia*" published by the U.S. consultancy Booz Allen Hamilton that predicted that China would expand its presence throughout the Indian Ocean by investing extensively in building massive civilian infrastructure in friendly states. China's that strategy was dubbed as String of Pearls and there have been a number of speculations and debates about China's intentions in building such facilities.[12]

This strategy is being termed as more military one than economic because sea lines run through several major choke points like Strait of Mallaca, Strait of Mandeb, Strait of Hormuz and Lombok Strait. Pakistan, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Maldives and Somalia are strategic maritime centers built for conducting trade and commerce with China but Indian media hypothetically declares it as countering India's influence through neighbours. China's String of Pearls strategy dreads India that former may use them for military purpose.

---

[11] Rank, M. "How The West Was Lost". *The Guardian*. (27/06/2018). Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/books/2009/jun/27/china-rules-world-martin-jacques

[12] Baker, B. D. " Where is the 'String of Pearls' in 2015?."*The Diplomat*, (2015): 5

Docking of Chinese submarines at China-constructed port in Sri Lanka is seen as militarization of BRI investments in India's neighbourhood. India's 90% international trade depends upon sea transport therefore it seeks to increase security by cooperating with Japan and the United States. India has reached a bilateral logistics exchange memorandum of agreement (LEMOA) with the U.S. in 2016. India has significantly increased security cooperation with Japan by selecting the latter as a permanent participant in U.S.-India Malabar security drills in 2015. India at the same time is struggling to address security deficits with China by keeping U.S and Japan engaged in the region.[13] Some of the empirical researches uncovered a positive correlation between alliances and conflict because states might constitute alliances in anticipation of conflict.[14] India may not ignore China's rise through diplomacy of development because it is likely to bring potential allies in China's orbit of influence. India employed traditional approach of counterbalancing through strategic relations with U.S. Japan and Israel. Such alliances are aimed at showcasing Indian might but helps averting direct armed-clash with China.

The China Development Bank has estimated that under the BRI, almost 900 projects worth $890 billion are currently underway and the major share of funding comes from China's leading financial institutions including Asian Infrastructural Bank (AIIB), China's Export-Import Bank, the Silk Road Fund and China Development Bank in partnership with other Chinese banks.[15] Because of the new heights in China-Pakistan relations after implementation of China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), China is set to sell 8 export-variant Yuan-class diesel submarines to Pakistan. India is uneasy with CPEC and made diplomatic efforts to halt this multi-billion mega project that would be connecting China's western province of Xinjiang with Pakistani ports of Gwadar and Karachi. This project will help prospering Xinjiang and Pakistan's Baluchistan province. India campaigns internationally that China is strategizing to encircle India through contrived

[13] Hays. J, Mitchel. "China's Belt and Road Initiative is Stoking Tensions with India". *The National Interest*. (16/11/207). Retrieved from http://nationalinterest.org/feature/chinas-belt-road-initiative-stoking-tensions-india-23234?page=4

[14] Kimball, Anessa L, "Alliance formation and conflict initiation: The missing link." *Journal of Peace Research* 43, no. 4 (2006): 372

[15] Prakash Panneerselvam, "Maritime Component of China–Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): India–China Competition in the Arabian Sea" , *Maritime Affairs: Journal of the National Maritime Foundation of India*,13(2) (2018):38

naval strategy. Because of India's animosity with China, no facility has been proposed in India.[16]

Response

The common question that needs clarity of answer that why does China want to spend trillion dollars for achieving mere connectivity of countries through massive infrastructural plan? China is set to spend about trillion dollars for the future of Afro-Eurasia, commonly known as Belt and Road Initiative (BRI). China's rise may face challenge from Southern and Western periphery therefore according to Chinese analysts Eurasian integration would create a more stable security environment around China's western and southern periphery by addressing sources of violence and strengthening mutual trust. As the demand for energy surges in future, China may add much to energy security by benefiting from diversifying energy supply routes.

According to a research publication entitled "Chinese Perspectives on the Belt Road Initiative: Strategic Rationales, Risks, and Implications" by *Center for the Study of Chinese Military Affairs Institute for National Strategic Studies*, Joel Wuthnow describes that China sees BRI as a way to achieve two following geopolitical objectives[17]

i. Seeking influence in the heartland of Eurasia
ii. Avoiding direct confrontation with the United States by exercising a restrained response to Obama's crafted rebalance to Asia policy.

China's massive military buildup and the sources of naval expeditionary capabilities are means to protect its overseas equities. To mitigate threats to China's overseas interests, a strong risk assessment couple with non-traditional security cooperation is highly essential. The utmost priority is to step up cooperation in the areas of counterterrorism that poses major threat to regional peace and stability. India and Pakistan have been close to escalation because of the cross-border terrorism. China's diplomatic maneuvers help it averting clash with regional and global players as it prefers to settle conflict on negotiating table. Chinese archaic strategic writings suggest that strategic competition can be avoided by co-opting with other major players which means that China may consider inclusion of the U.S. Russia, UK and other major powers in the development of BRI. Another smart move is to avoid encroaching upon others' sphere of influence.[18]

---

[16] Pillalamarri, Akhilesh. "What India Gets Wrong About China." *The Diplomat*. (7/6/2017). Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2014/06/what-india-gets-wrong-about-china/

[17] Wuthnow, J. *Chinese Perspectives on the Belt and Road Initiative: Strategic Rationales, Risks, and Implications*. (National Defense University Press, 2017)

[18] Ibid.

The U.S. is sensing out that if China establishes a Sino-centric order in Eurasia that is likely to undermine former's strategic interests. If China maintains non-confrontational relations with the United States, it may establish a sphere of influence in Eurasia. An overreliance of BRI partners on China's economic largesse worries Washington even more because once in Chinese orbit of influence, they may not serve U.S. interests in a better way. China faces two tough competitors, one at regional level and the other at global level. India competes with China concerning regional influence on small neighbours whereas the United States perceive China as a global competitor. Even a larger challenge for China's peaceful rise is to face and deal with Indo-US strategic partnership that is a stumbling stone in its way.

Curtailing China's Regional Influence

On the other hand China is a focal point of India's foreign policy. Indian defeat in 1962 war alarms even more as China continues flexing its economic muscle in recent times. India concerns that China may transform economic strength into politico-strategic to put India into a state of serious security dilemma. What baffles more to people is that India and China are also largest trading partners in the region and also the members to several regional and international organizations. India and China are members of BRICS (Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa), Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) and Group of twenty (G-20).

India is a potential candidate for membership of Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG) and United Nations Security Council (UNSC). India's entry into NSG and UNSC will put India at a place where United State can counterbalance China through India only without mobilizing other allies. Panos Mourdoukoutas in his piece "The Real Reason China Won't Let India Join NSG" published in *Forbes* that China has a loud and clear message for India that there no place for India in Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG). China legally objects India's entry into NSG because India is not a member of Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT) regime. There is a prerequisite that to be member of NSG a state ought to be a signatory of NPT. China attaches much value to NPT as Wang Qun, Director General of the Department of Arms Control of the Chinese Foreign Ministry stated "In the absence of NPT as the political and legal basis, how could the nuclear issue on the Korean Peninsula be resolved?"[19]

Ashley Tellis in his *structuralist approach* argues that India and China being rising powers remain natural competitors to expand their area of influence

[19] The real reason China Won't Let India Join NSG (2016,June30), *Forbes*. Retrieved from https://www.forbes.com/sites/panosmourdoukoutas/2016/06/30/the-real-reason-china-wont-let-india-join-nsg/#22b9a8f15ae5

beyond South Asia. He also predicts about burgeoning military might of India and China that if both competitors continue to grow militarily and economically at current rapid pace then chances of dyadic rivalry are more vivid.[20] The BRI presents an opportunity to demonstrate Chinese leadership for reaping fruits of economic and diplomatic power at world stage. China's connectivity with less developed neighbours could enable China to outsource low income jobs and move up the value chain. Such measures will help China to counter "middle-income trap".

India is trying to catch up with China's pace of economic development. In global competitive Index ranking (2017-2018) which is based on institutions and policies that basically determine the factor of productivity, China was ranked 27th and India 40th whereas Pakistan's ranking stood at 115th number out of 137 countries in the world.[21] According to estimates after the completion of BRI, China's annual trade volume would dramatically rise to US $2.5 within ten years.[22]

China's secret to peaceful rise lies with the fact to avoid any confrontation with India as well as in South China Sea where it has contentious issues with Japan, Philippines, Vietnam, Malaysia and Brunei have competing claims over Spratly Islands, Paracels Islands and Scarborough Shoal. Based on Chinese history as a big brother of South East Asian states during Tributary system times, China claims the larger part of these islands. That area is defined by "nine-dash line" that stretches hundreds of miles from it Southern province of Hainan.[23] India is sanguine of China's troubles if China fails to manage conflict in South China Sea with these neighbours. India has leveled more reinvigorated strategic ties with Japan to pose future challenges to China. China is likely to calibrate its policy towards India as the future of Sino-Indian bilateral relations would be shaped by geostrategic consequences and India's relationship with major players like Russia, U.S., EU and Japan.

---

[20] Ashley J. Tell is, "China and India in Asia," in Francine R. Frankel and Harry, In Harding (ed.), *The India-China Relationship: What the United States Needs to Know*, (Columbia University Press, New York, 2004): 134-177

[21] Schwab, Klaus, The Global Competitiveness Report. *World Economic Forum*, (2017-2018). Retrieved from http://www3.weforum.org/docs/GCR2017-2018/05FullReport/TheGlobalCompetitivenessReport2017%E2%80%932018.pdf

[22] Panneerselvam, Prakash, "Maritime Component of China–Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): India–China Competition in the Arabian Sea." *Maritime Affairs: Journal of the National Maritime Foundation of India*, (2018): 38

[23] "Why is South China Sea Continuous?" . *BBC News*. 12/07/2016.Retrieved from http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-pacific-13748349

Action through the Corridor of Opportunities

Though Pakistan and China are close friends and neighbours but bilateral trade has not been much impressive. Pakistan-China trade volume was $4 billion in 2006-07 but in 2015-16 it has reached 13.77 billion and Pakistan's exports jumped to 1.69 billion.[24] Pakistan's Parliamentary Secretary for Commerce Najeebuddin Awaisi told National Assembly that China's exports to Pakistan increased to $12.1 billion in 2015-16 from $3.5 billion in 2006-07. He also added that Pakistan's ministry is taking measures to attain balance of trade with China.[25] The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) provides both the nations a platform to promote regional trade activity. The CPEC is also dubbed as corridor of opportunity because it connects Pakistan's potential Gwadar port with China's Western province Xinjiang. It would provide an open access to South Asia and Indian Ocean. China's interest in the Makran coast raises suspicions among analysts that why China is much interested in the Makran coast. The Makran coast being close to Persian Gulf provides China an opportunity to maximize economic benefits in Persian Gulf. Indian analysts are apprehensive of navigation of China's naval ships and submarines at Pakistan's port and forecast that Sino-Indian security tension may heighten. India's massive labour are serving in United Arab Emirates, Qatar, Kuwait and Bahrain which India is worried about that after the CPEC project it may challenge India's growing interests in Persian Gulf on one hand and undermine its role as a regional maritime power.[26]

After commencement of CPEC, Gwadar has emerged as a major commercial hub in the region because massive Chinese trade will be passing through this port. Pakistan navy has to safeguard Gwadar facility for which Pakistan Navy constituted "Task Force-88". The Task Force-88(TF-88) is responsible for securing Gwadar port and adjunct sea-lanes. Second layer of security is of Jinnah Naval Base at Ormara in Baluchistan province. Other ports including Pasni and Jewani have also been expanded as part of CPEC project. Jinnah Naval Base advantages tactically to Pakistan Navy as in case of emergency the reaction time will be reduced by 6 to 8 hours. Jinnah Naval Base has recently been upgraded with a workshop to overhaul naval ships of different sizes and submarines as well. Major benefit of this naval infrastructure is that it can provide security to international shipping lane (ISL) between Persian Gulf and Gwadar Port. Pakistan's naval infrastructure

[24] Saeed, Aamir."Pakistan-China Trade Volume Reaches $13.7 Billion in 2015-2016 NA Informed*". Business Recorder*, (14/03/2017). Retrieved from https://fp.brecorder.com/2017/03/20170314153866/

[25] Ibid.

[26] Panneerselvam, Prakash, "Maritime Component of China–Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): India–China Competition in the Arabian Sea." *Maritime Affairs.* (National Maritime Foundation of India, 2018): 37

including listening posts and maritime surveillance capability enables Pakistan to track any movement at the mouth of Persian Gulf. Pakistan's Defence Minister Khawaja Muhammad Asif stated during the gathering of Jinnah Naval Base that "the success of the CPEC and Gwadar Port project depends upon secure maritime environment in the Indian Ocean region and in particular Arabian Sea for which Pakistan navy was fully prepared"[27]

China's planned investment in other South Asian nations is also part of the BRI. China has invested $14 billion for infrastructural projects in Sri Lanka from 2005 to 2015. China pledged $38 billion to Bangladesh and $8 billion to Nepal as planned investments. India's influence in the region is dwindling down with increased Chinese economic penetration. Another Indian fear that China's String of Pearls may encircle India and check latter's naval interests. After Gwadar Port and Hambantota (Sri Lanka), Indian foreign policy is strategizing to respond to Chinese naval strategy and maritime projects.

India has leverage in terms of economic growth in South Asia because it is a member of G-20 which is world's largest and advanced economies representing world's two-third population also 85 % of global gross domestic product and over 75 % of global trade.[28] India is the only country from South Asia having membership to world's leading economic forum (G-20). Its membership of G-20 counts it in the leading economies like Australia, Brazil, Canada, Argentina, France, Germany , China, Italy, Indonesia, Japan, Republic of Korea, South Africa, Saudi Arabia, Russia, Turkey, The United Kingdom, The United States and the European Union. Pakistan's economy is going to experience a stark boost in the next five years because of CEPC and it would uplift Pakistan's economic stature. As CPEC projects are under way and other developed countries are interested to invest money or be partners in several projects, Pakistan in February, 2018 has turned down an offer of loan from Japan for infrastructural projects arguing that country's loan portfolio is already up and it doesn't need any other loan.[29]

To empower people of Baluchistan through education, CPEC is aiming to build an educational city. The Higher Education Commission unit of CPEC is in the process of reviewing government-university and educational city projects in Gwadar. Technical Review Committee comprising of vice-

---

[27] "Is China's Silk Road Game Changer?". *BBC News*. (April 2015). Retrieved from http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-32400091 & Ahimullah Yousafzai and T. Mehdi. "The Way of Sufi." *NEWSLINE*. (November 1994).

[28] *Turkey G-20* (2015). Retrieved from http://g20.org.tr/about-g20/g20-members/

[29] Bhutta,Zafar. "Pakistan Turn Down Cheaper Loan Offer from Japan". *The Express Tribune.* (02/2018). Retrieved from https://tribune.com.pk/story/1637886/2-pakistan-turns-cheaper-loan-offer-japan/

chancellors of famous university and government officials are exploring opportunities to provide employment to people of Baluchistan and also enable them to get better jobs in competitive job market by imparting them technical training.[30]

According to that report Pakistan is spending more than one billion dollars on improving quality of the roads which has ultimate impact on per capita income of the people. It is likely to increase per capita income of people by Rs. 371 on permanent basis. It will also help people driving them out of absolute poverty as it provides sustainable solution to alleviate poverty than mere spending subsidies.[31] India's old strategic partner Russia has developed better ties with Pakistan and is aspiring to join CPEC too. Pakistan has also approved Russia request to use Gwadar Port for Russian exports of goods to West Asia, Africa and Latin America.[32] After the disintegration of USSR, Russia lost its presence in the Indian Ocean Region (IOR). China's BRI provides Russia an opportunity to regain foothold in Indian Ocean. Russia's engagement with the BRI helps it to resurge in IOR, another development that presents Indo-US strategic partnership a gigantic challenge is China-Russia-Pakistan triad that is shaping up under the umbrella of CPEC. India being potential regional player would never want to face such strategic challenge in the region.[33] Russia's closeness with Pakistan will add much value to latter's strategic power in world affairs.

India's Neighbourhood First Policy: Neutralizing China's Regional Influence

After China's increased influence among small South Asian neighbours, Indian Prime Minister Narenra Modi ramps up an effort to keep South Asian neighbours in sphere of influence. He initiated "Neighbourhood First" Policy in May, 2014 during South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC). India's neighourhood first policy is a strategic necessity whose striking feature is that if India does not resolve issues with neighbor, China may capitalize the situation to exert regional influence. Modi's this diplomatic approach earned him popularity at home among Hindu nationalists. Such regional diplomatic maneuver is supplemented by

---

[30] "*CPEC's HEC Building Education City in Gawadar*", (02/02/2018). Retrieved from https://tribune.com.pk/story/1624418/1-cpecs-hec-building-education-city-gwadar/

[31] Mehar, A ," Infrastructure development, CPEC and FDI in Pakistan: is there any connection?". *Transnational Corporations Review, 9*(3), (2017): 232

[32] "Pakistan Allows Russia Use Gawadar Under China Pakistan Economic Corridor." *Hindustan Times*. (26/11/2016). Retrieved from https://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/pakistan-allows-russia-use-of-gwadar-port-under-china-pak-economic-corridor/story-8YuUCrYTU2Kj7mQIIvpNzO.html

[33] Srivastava, N. "Prospects for Russia–India Relations in the Indian Ocean Region". *Maritime Affairs: Journal of the National Maritime Foundation of India*, 13(1), (2017): 88

India's strategic position, economic complementary and shared cultural heritage.[34] Though India had diminutive success but was not an adequate response to China's investment in Bangladesh. India is among those few states who are not taking part in China's Belt and Road Initiative. The only option India had was to bandwagon United States to join U.S. led ventures of development in Asia.

China's billions of dollars investment for new infrastructural projects in Sri Lanka put India in comfortless position as Sri Lanka has long been in India's geopolitical orbit. The impact of Chinese massive investment in Sri Lanka had contesting response from India. Sri Lanka' President Maithripala Sirisena paid first visit to India in February, 2015 and was reciprocated by Modi's visit to Colombo in March, 2015. It was first stand-alone PM visit in 28 years and he also addressed Sri Lankan Parliament. India exercised humanitarian diplomacy by constructing a hospital there. After China's BRI, Sri Lanka enjoyed special significance in China's foreign policy. Under the lease agreement between China and Sri Lanka, strategic port of Hambantota was handed over to China for 99-years lease. But Sri Lanka sought assurance that Hambantota port will not be used for military purposes. To monitor Chinese activities at the port India has invested in Hambantota district airport which is merely 30 kilometers away from the port.[35]

Another South Asian small but strategically important state Maldives has long been neglected by India but with the advent of Chinese investment, India also moved to reach for cooperation with Maldives in the areas of defence and tourism. Maldivian President Abdullah Yameen during his visit to India in April, 2016 signed agreements of cooperation in the field of taxation, space research, tourism and defence. Such diplomatic move of India was aimed at countering growing Chinese influence in the Island state. Other countries operated through their embassies either in Delhi or Colombo but China was opened up an embassy in Male. An important landmark in China-Maldives relations is the Free Trade Agreement (FTA) reached in December, 2017, making Maldives the first ever FTA with any other country and China's second FTA with any South Asia country. China already has an FTA with Pakistan based on China Pakistan's exemplary relationship. As a result of China's massive support for Maldives, President Yameen pledged his full support to China's Maritime Silk Road (MDR). India's foreign ministry issued a statement that "expectation that as a close and friendly

[34] Kaura, V. "Grading India's Neighbourhood Diplomacy". *The Diplomat*. (01/01/2018). Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2017/12/grading-indias-neighborhood-diplomacy/

[35] PTI. "Lanka Formally hands Over Hambantota Port to China". *Times of India*. (09/12/2017). Retrieved from https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/south-asia/sri-lanka-formally-hands-over-hambantota-port-to-china/articleshow/61997671.cms

neighbour, Maldives will be sensitive to our concerns, in keeping with its 'India First' policy."[36]

Nepal matters to India because it is a landlocked country and depends mostly on India concerning transportation of goods and access to sea. Nepal mainly imports goods from China because of being a developed country and in neighbourhood. Nepal's earthquake of 2015 wreaked havoc and India carried out extensive rescue operations couple with financial support for reconstruction projects. But India's hegemonic behavior with Nepal dragged it closer to China. Kathmandu has already reached agreement of BRI plan. Under the proposed plan both countries will cement their communication links and China would initiate number of development projects in Nepal. The BRI is seriously undermining Modi's neighbourhood first policy. On the other hand Nepal is set to prefer China's model of development over India's 'neighbourhood first' policy. The BRI has smartly hijacked Indian hegemonic ambitions in the region by brining all neighbours into Chinese orbit of influence.

The real success story of India's heighbourhood policy is in Afghanistan only. Modi, during his visit to Afghanistan in December, 2015 inaugurated the Afghan Parliament building which was constructed with India's financial assistance. In another trip to Afghanistan in June, 2016, Indian PM inaugurated Salma Dam in Herat. That is the almost the same strategy that China employed in other South Asian States through diplomacy of economic assistance. India's investment in Afghanistan for reconstruction and development stands at $2billion which makes it the biggest donor among other regional states. India even was seeking transit trade with Afghanistan via Wagah-Attari border and threatened to block Pakistan's access to Central Asian states if the demand was not met. New Delhi-Kabul got an alternate route to enhance connectivity through Iran's strategic port of Chabahar. India is aiming to reach out to Central Asia to neutralize Chinese influence in the region and turning Pakistan's western border (Afghanistan) another security challenge for Pakistan. Some analysts view Chabahar as a counterweight of Gwadar in the region which India may use in future to maintain naval supremacy.

Bangladesh provided a strategically good opportunity to India under India's neighbourhood first policy. India-and Bangladesh in July 2014, accepted the judgment of International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea and subsequently settled a long-festering maritime dispute. The Bangladesh-Bhutan-India-

[36] IANS . "Maldives-China FTA:India Breaks Silence". *The Economic Times*. (14/12/2017). Retrieved from https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/maldives-china-fta-india-breaks-its-silence/articleshow/62072220.cms

Nepal (BBIN) initiative and the Bay of Bengal Initiative for Multi-sectoral Technical and Economic Cooperation (BIMSTEC) showcases that India's neighbourhood first policy succeeded only in Bangladesh. India's former Foreign Secretary S. Jaishankar stated that "If there is one example where the neighborhood first policy has yielded good result, it is in case of Bangladesh."[37]

Pakistan's relations with Afghanistan have not been smooth since Karzai's government in Kabul. India developed strategic ties with Karzai government and tried to malign Pakistan in international community as a supporter of Taliban and terrorist networks whereas Pakistan is waging war against Al-Qaeda, Taliban and other terrorist networks since 2001. The United States supports activities of Indian women organization Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA) through the funding of United States Agency for International Development (USAID). New Delhi's strategy of pulling Kabul into its sphere of influence is based on developmental projects. One of the tangible strategic project is the construction of Zarjan Delaram (218km) road that will be connecting landlocked Afghanistan to Iranian port Chabahar. India wants access to energy rich central Asian states via that alternate route.[38]

Taliban, after the U.S. attack on Afghanistan are putting up fierce insurgency to the U.S. and International Security Assistance Force (ISAF), India being U.S. ally also came under Taliban attacks in Afghanistan multiple times. The United States unwavering support for Indian presence into Afghanistan clarifies Indian strategic interests. General McChrystal then NATO commander in Afghanistan opined:

> "Indian political and economic influence is increasing in Afghanistan, including significant development efforts and financial investment. In addition, the current Afghan government is perceived by Islamabad to be pro-Indian. While Indian activities largely benefit the Afghan people, increasing Indian influence in Afghanistan is likely to exacerbate regional tensions and encourage Pakistani countermeasures in Afghanistan or India".[39]

Indian strategic ambitions either in Afghanistan or some other South Asian are largely based on projecting Indian interest and undermining Pakistan and

---

[37] Kaura, V. "Grading India's Neighbourhood Diplomacy". *The Diplomat.* (01/01/2018). Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2017/12/grading-indias-neighborhood-diplomacy/

[38] Souza, Shantie M. et al."Securing India's Interests in Afghanistan". *The Hindu.* (17/12/2016). Retrieved from http://www.thehindu.com/opinion/lead/Securing-Indiarsquos-interests-in-Afghanistan/article16888279.ece

[39] Fair, C. Christian. "India in Afghanistan, Strategic Interests, Regional Concerns." *Foreign Policy,* (26/10/2010). Retrieved from http://foreignpolicy.com/2010/10/26/india-in-afghanistan-part-i-strategic-interests-regional-concerns/

China's interests in the region especially after the initiation of the BRI. Another factor that attracts India into Afghanistan is tapping mineral resources worth $ 1 trillion that may give leverage to India over Pakistan and China in Afghanistan. Not only India eyes on mineral resources but the United States too. A recent study claims that mineral resources in Afghanistan are worth $3 trillion and Trump administration is trying to recoup $700 billion that the U.S. spent in war against terrorism on Afghanistan.[40] An unexpected rejuvenation of TAPI (Turkmenistan-Afghanistan-Pakistan-India) gas-pipeline which was halted because of disagreement between New Delhi-Islamabad and New Delhi-Kabul over transit fee, is the glaring evidence that India is willing to pay more but does not want to lose influence in Afghanistan at any cost. The TAPI gas-pipeline 1,800-kilometer long has an estimate price of $10 billion and will be bringing 33 billion cubic metres of Turkmenistan gas to energy-deficient South Asia for about 30 years.[41] A strange thing in the construction of pipeline is that Taliban posed serious threats to destroy this pipeline earlier but now after the inauguration they vowed to secure the pipeline.[42] India's contemporary approach of dealing with neighbours still contains elements of 'Indira Doctrine', which was named after former Indian Prime Minister. According to Indira doctrine, domestic political conflicts in neighbourhood should be resolved through India's help.

India's reincarnation of 1990s "Look East" after Modi's strategy is turning into "Act East" policy. Act East policy would promote foreign trade in competition to China and Pakistan. India after assessing failure of SAARC as a regional economic cooperation is giving serious try to ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asian Nations) countries for enhancing economic, political and military ties that underpins Indian influence and undermine China's sphere of influence. Its objective is to intensify economic, political and military relations with Japan and member states of the ASEAN.[43]

---

[40] Amini, Mariam. "At Stake in U.S. Military Efforts to Stabilize Afghanistan: At Least $3 trillion in Natural Resources" *CNBC*, (19/07/2017). Retrieved from https://www.cnbc.com/2017/08/18/trumps-afghanistan-strategy-may-unlock-3-trillion-in-natural-resources.html

[41] Catherine, P. "TAPI Moves Into Afghanistan, Taliban Promise to Protect the Project*"*. *The Diplomat*, (17/02/2018). Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2018/02/tapi-moves-into-afghanistan-taliban-promise-to-protect-the-project/

[42] Ibid.

[43] Sudhanshu,T."Why is India Switching from Look East to Act East Policy". *Asia Times*. (15/06/2017). Retrieved from http://www.atimes.com/india-switching-look-east-act-east-policy/

The U.S. President Donald Trump during his trip to Asia had a meeting with Asian allies including Japan, Philippine, Australia and India in November, 2017 to revitalize former quadrilateral initiative. The members of Quad initiative are ganging up to oppose China's Belt and Road Initiative. The Quad initiative is also against the foundation of Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank. India's revivalism of bilateral economic and military ties with other Quad members could not reach an agreed upon common declaration in recent years but India with another U.S. ally (Japan) is attempting to establish a counter-model to China's mega project. In responding to increased Chinese influence, India is even valuing small island nations including Mauritius, Maldives, the Seychelles and Comoros by enhancing military cooperation with them. Modi government is vying to bring up a counterweight to BRI by introducing Mausam project in 2014 and SAGAR (Security and Growth for All in the Region) in 2015. The problem that India faces in attracting other nations is that India has fewer political, economic and military resources to execute foreign policy ventures compared to China. India in collaboration with Russia and Iran envisaged trilateral project of the International North-South Transport Corridor in 2015. International North-South Transport Corridor begins at Iranian port of Chabahar and provides access to Afghanistan, Central Asian States and Russia. Because of Pakistan-Afghanistan rocky relations, Pakistan has refused overland trade to latter with India because of the security concerns as India has been engaged in sabotaging peace in Baluchistan province. Kulbhushan Yadav a captured Indian spy has confessed Indian activities to sabotage peace in Pakistan. Pakistan's Gwadar port is set to make Gwadar a hub of trade regional trade activity. India already has allocated in May, 2016 an amount of $500 million for development of Chabahar which is about 70 kilometers from Gwadar. In the month of October, 2017 India shipped first consignment of wheat to Afghanistan via Chabahar port. India's investment in infrastructural projects of Afghanistan and Iran are aimed at neutralizing Pakistan's influence on those neighbouring countries. Asian order is somewhat China-centric as Asian states either are partners with China or want to benefit from China's BRI project but India. India has limited economic resources to match political influence with China. India and the European Union have already expressed willingness to cooperate in Indian Ocean militarily particularly off the coast of Somalia as part of Operation Atlanta. France is a European country that enjoys closest ties with India in terms of security policy. Both the countries have cooperated in arms and civil nuclear technology as well. France's overseas department Réunion makes it an essential partner in Indian Ocean. Another European partner that shows great interest in bolstering democratic ideals in South Asia is Germany. Germany has an interest in strengthening democratic norms and curb religious extremism in Afghanistan, Nepal and Bangladesh. India's

partnership with European powerful states provides an impetus to India's strategic partnership with the EU states.

China's growing interest in Pakistan is seen as major concern by some of the propagandists that China is likely to acquire military base Pakistan based at Jiwani. Jiwani is about 80 kilometers apart from Gwadar and in close proximity of Iranian border on the gulf of Oman. According to Bill Gertz of *Washington Times*, China has already acquired a military base at Djubuti in August, 2017 and now it would be a second foreign military base.[44] To guard Gwadar China envisages joint naval and Air facility at a short distance of Gwadar.

India-China relations have not been much smooth but the year 2017 experienced renewed tensions close to disputed border area. Tensions mounted with the visit of Dalai Lama to disputed Arunachal Pradesh and China also blocked India's fierce diplomatic endeavors to designate Jaish-e-Mohammed chief Maulana Masood Azhar a global terrorist. Other tensions included Doklam military standoff, prompted by China's construction of a road in disputed territory of Bhutan but not far from India-China border. India stood out as to boycott the BRI Summit held at Beijing in May, 2017. India was hoping that other nations including Japan and United States will also boycott the summit but they attended the summit which further deteriorated China-India relations. India's hostility to unprecedented project (BRI) is to deny Beijing as international leader of development. Chinese President Xi Jinping's immediate snub to India was also about securing and legitimizing the CPEC that India claims it passes through disputed area with Pakistan. Quadrilateral Security Dialogue held in November, 2017 between India, the United States, Japan and Australia had a naval component that Beijing opposed as a potential alliance of democracies against China's maritime rise in Indo-Pacific region.[45] China may further its goals by successfully completing BRI in general.

China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) is set to promote connectivity across Pakistan by developing roads, railways, pipelines, energy projects, industrial zones and related infrastructural projects .The CPEC will address energy crisis and boost economic growth in Pakistan. China's city of Kashgar will be connected with Pakistan's Gawadar port by facilitating trade between China and rest of the world particularly Indian ocean states.

---

[44] Gertz, B. "China Building Military Base in Pakistan". *The Washington* Times. (3/1/2018). Retrieved from https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2018/jan/3/china-plans-pakistan-military-base-at-jiwani/

[45] Lidarev, I. "A Tough Year for China-India Relations*". The Diplomat*, (4/1/2018). Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2018/01/2017-a-tough-year-for-china-india-relations/

Completion of CPEC will also address issue of Xinjiang by promoting trade and infrastructure. Another benefit that China may get is to alleviate 'Mallaca Dilemma' that China is vulnerable to as roughly 85% of China's oil imports pass through this chokepoint and any interruption may incur heavy loss to China's oil imports. Gawadar is likely to provide a substitute to China and may minimize reliance over strait of Mallaca route. Reliance on Gawadar would reap high economic benefits for Pakistan and Baluchistan may experience rapid economic growth couple with development. Pakistan and China are determined to combat terrorism as both countries often hold joint military exercises to control terrorist activities in their respective countries. East Turkestan Islamic Movement (ETIM) fighters have been cozying up with Al-Qaeda and Islamic State and such terrorist groups are planning to sabotage economic development. China-Pakistan have planned strategy to combat such groups to avert any threats to Chinese working on CPEC as well as protecting Pakistan's strategic sites.
Under the CPEC three highway routes would be connecting various provinces of Pakistan. Western route would be passing through Pakistan's underdeveloped but significant provinces i.e. Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as Eastern route will pass through Sindh and Punjab whereas central route crisscrosses the whole country. The Northern route connects to Kashgar via the Karakoram Highway. Indian stupendous diplomatic efforts to stagimatise BRI as China's imperialist design to control other countries whereas CPEC is being maligned as a project of military that Gawadar would be used against India by China-Pakistan join navy.

The success of the project is that some major powers including Russia are becoming part of this mega project. A stable Pakistan and Sino-centric Asian order is unacceptable for India, therefore, it opposes CPEC and BRI and counter-allying with Japan to balance China. China's support to Pakistan in achieving Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG) testifies invincible friendship. The BRI is an approach that would make China a natural leader of Eurasia.

Conclusion

International order has never been the constant. Major powers continue their struggle to become super power and rising challengers continue to challenge former's supremacy. China's rise to world's centre-stage is viewed as triumph of multilateralism in which all the stake-holders will benefit from the system. The BRI is a mega project that will provide China ascendency to the position of super-power. India, being a competitive neighbour has possible ramifications for China's rise. Indian P.M Modi is aiming for counter-weighing the BRI and therefore launched SAGAR and Mausam projects which reflect India's relentless efforts to catch up with China. India is also becoming the member of world's powerful bodies like

G-20 and is striving to achieve permanent membership of the United Nations Security Council. China aims to maintain balance of power between India and Pakistan therefore, laying more emphasis on successful completion of flagship project of the BRI (CPEC). China-Pakistan Economic Corridor has been under immense propaganda from India because of India's efforts to halt this project. If China's BRI project is completed, it certainly is going to change power-landscape in world arena in 50 years to come. Pakistan's reliance on the U.S. is also minimizing and a new chapter of Russia-Pakistan relations is in the offing.

Bibliography

Amini, Mariam. "At Stake in U.S. Military Efforts to Stabilize Afghanistan: At Least $3 trillion in Natural Resources" *CNBC*.19/07/2017. Retrieved from https://www.cnbc.com/2017/08/18/trumps-afghanistan-strategy-may-unlock-3-trillion-in-natural-resources.html

Ashley J. Tell is, "China and India in Asia," in Francine R. Frankel and Harry Harding (eds). *The India-China Relationship: What the United States Needs to Know*, Columbia University Press, New York, 2004

Bhutta, Zafar. "Pakistan Turn Down Cheaper Loan Offer from Japan". *The Express Tribune*. 02/2018. Retrieved from https://tribune.com.pk/story/1637886/2-pakistan-turns-cheaper-loan-offer-japan/

Catherine, P. "TAPI Moves Into Afghanistan, Taliban Promise to Protect the Project". *The Diplomat*. 17/02/2018. Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2018/02/tapi-moves-into-afghanistan-taliban-promise-to-protect-the-project/

CPEC's HEC Building Education City in Gawadar., 02/02/2018. Retrieved from https://tribune.com.pk/story/1624418/1-cpecs-hec-building-education-city-gwadar/

Fair, C. Christian. "India in Afghanistan, Strategic Interests, Regional Concerns." *Foreign Policy*.26/10/2010. Retrieved from http://foreignpolicy.com/2010/10/26/india-in-afghanistan-part-i-strategic-interests-regional-concerns/

Gertz, B. "China Building Military Base in Pakistan". *The Washington Times*. 3/1/2018. Retrieved from https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2018/jan/3/china-plans-pakistan-military-base-at-jiwani/

Hays. J, Mitchel. "China's Belt and Road Initiative is Stoking Tensions with India". *The National Interest*. 16/11/207. Retrieved from http://nationalinterest.org/feature/chinas-belt-road-initiative-stoking-tensions-india-23234?page=4

IANS . "Maldives-China FTA: India Breaks Silence". *The Economic Times*. 14/12/2017. Retrieved from https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/foreign-trade/maldives-china-fta-india-breaks-its-silence/articleshow/62072220.cms

Kaura, V. "Grading India's Neighbourhood Diplomacy". *The Diplomat*. 01/01/2018. Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2017/12/grading-indias-neighborhood-diplomacy/

Kimball, Anessa L, "Alliance formation and conflict initiation: The missing link." *Journal of Peace Research* 43(4), 2006

Lidarev, I. "A Tough Year for China-India Relations". *The Diplomat*. 4/1/2018. Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2018/01/2017-a-tough-year-for-china-india-relations/

Madan, T. India's relations with China: the good, the bad and the (potentially) ugly. *Brookings Institute Series: Brookings East Asia Commentary*, (72), 2013

Mehar, A ," Infrastructure development, CPEC and FDI in Pakistan: is there any connection?". *Transnational corporations review*, *9*(3), 2017

Mohan, C. R. "India and the Balance of Power." Foreign Affairs. 2006

Monteleone Davide. "A New Silk Road". *The New Yorker*. 18/12018. Retrieved from https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2018/01/08/a-new-silk-road

Pakistan Allows Russia Use Gawadar Under China Pakistan Economic Corridor." *Hindustan Times*. 26/11/2016. Retrieved from https://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/pakistan-allows-russia-use-of-gwadar-port-under-china-pak-economic-corridor/story-8YuUCrYTU2Kj7mQIIvpNzO.html

Pant, H. V. "Indian foreign policy and China". *Strategic Analysis*, *30*(4), 2006

Pillalamarri, Akhilesh. "What India Gets Wrong About China." The Diplomat. 7/6/2017.Retrieved from https://thediplomat.com/2014/06/what-india-gets-wrong-about-china/

Prakash Panneerselvam, "Maritime Component of China–Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): India–China Competition in the Arabian Sea" , *Maritime Affairs*, 13(2), Journal of the National Maritime Foundation of India, 2018

PTI. "Lanka Formally hands Over Hambantota Port to China". *Times of India*. 09/12/2017. Retrieved from https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/south-asia/sri-lanka-formally-hands-over-hambantota-port-to-china/articleshow/61997671.cms

Rank, M. "How The West Was Lost". *The Guardian*. 27/06/2018. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/books/2009/jun/27/china-rules-world-martin-jacques

Saeed, Aamir."Pakistan-China Trade Volume Reaches $13.7 Billion in 2015-2016 NA Informed". *Business Recorder*.14/03/2017 Retrieved from https://fp.brecorder.com/2017/03/20170314153866/

Souza, Shantie M. et al."Securing India's Interests in Afghanistan". *The Hindu*. 17/12/2016. Retrieved from http://www.thehindu.com/opinion/lead/Securing-Indiarsquos-interests-in-Afghanistan/article16888279.ece

Srivastava, N. "Prospects for Russia–India Relations in the Indian Ocean Region". *Maritime Affairs, 13*(1), Journal of the National Maritime Foundation of India, 2017

Sudhanshu,T."Why is India Switching from Look East to Act East Policy". *Asia Times*. 15/06/2017. Retrieved from http://www.atimes.com/india-switching-look-east-act-east-policy/

Swaine, M. D. Chinese views and commentary on the 'One Belt, One Road' initiative. *China Leadership Monitor, 47*(2), (2015).

The Real Reason China Won't Let India Join NSG. 2016, June 30. Retrieved from https://www.forbes.com/sites/panosmourdoukoutas/2016/06/30/the-real-reason-china-wont-let-india-join-nsg/#22b9a8f15ae5

Turkey G-20. 2015. Retrieved from http://g20.org.tr/about-g20/g20-members/

Wuthnow, J. *Chinese Perspectives on the Belt and Road Initiative: Strategic Rationales, Risks, and Implications*. National Defense University Press, 2017

Ye, H. India's Policy Towards China Under the Mindset of "Assertive Government". In *Annual Report on the Development of the Indian Ocean Region*. Springer, Singapore, 2015

Central Asia Journal No. 81, Winter 2017

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION'S AGREEMENTS AFFECTING PAK-AFGHAN BORDER TRIBES

Noreen Naseer*

Abstract

This paper attempts to highlight the perceived threats of World Trade Organization's certain agreements to the livelihood of the tribes residing erstwhile FATA and adjacent five-border provinces/wilayatona of Afghanistan. There are seventeen agreements of WTO that deals with issues related to trade and commerce. The Agreement on Agriculture offers obligations for member states in the area of market access, tariff regulations, export competition, domestic support, export subsidies, food security, and environmental protection. If agreements such as Agreement on Agriculture, General Agreement on Trade and Services, Trade Policy Review Mechanism and Social Clause are extended without adjustment to the needs of poor nations and sub-nations living on the peripheries, then it may prove detrimental to their survival. To substantiate my argument, I have briefly discussed the adverse affects and recorded protests against such agreements by the poor indigenous people living across the world's different peripheries.

Key Words: WTO, FATA, Afghan Wilayatona and Tribes' livelihood

Introduction

In 1989 with the collapse of Communism, independent system[1] dissolved, security concerns replaced economic concerns, although two systems, one of North-North interdependence (corporate capitalists) and second of North-South (neo-colonization) dependence prevailed. To address certain economic concerns in the North, first wave of theorists emerged, integrating the world with the 'Theory of Globalization'[2] and its inherent

* Presently serving as Lecturer, Department of Political Science, University of Peshawar

[1] During Cold War communist states refused to interact economically and politically outside their own states and ideological partners, hence many scholars defined it isolated and independent system.

[2] The term globalization used by the marketing professor Levitt Theodore in his article for *Harvard Business Review*, "*The Globalization of Markets"* 1983, and stated that globalization promotes convergence, harmonization, efficiency, growth, democratization

capitalist view. They associated globalization with the new economic world order, identifying it with the development and growth agenda.[3] Globalization is defined in different contexts but in the framework of economics, Joseph Stiglitz defined globalization as "the closer integration of the countries and peoples of the world brought about by the enormous reduction of costs of transportation and communication, and the breaking down of artificial barriers to the flows of goods, capital, services, knowledge, and people across borders."[4] Stiglitz, while defining globalization, also discussed that the needs of the poor South in this arrangement should be re-thought by the rich North.[5] This view by the eminent economist generated a debate of 're-thinking of South's needs' and many scholars started a debate of reforming the present economic system. They are of the opinion that the integrating world economy in the framework of globalization through free and liberal trade with neoliberal principles of WTO can prove fatal for the South's impoverished economies and people (nations/sub-nations/tribes living on the impoverished peripheries too).

The first wave of globalization advocates known as globalists/hyperactive globalists, consider globalization and liberalization of international trade essential and favorable for all states including developing and least developed states. The supporters of globalization believe that through liberal trade, capital and services will flow easily amongst the states with the help of Multinational Corporations (MNCs) and foreign direct investment, thus will create employment opportunities for economically hard-pressed poor states. It will also assist in transfer of technology from industrialized developed states and create a competitive environment that will improve the quality of goods and facilitate consumers for better and affordable choices.[6]

The second wave of scholars, skeptics of globalization theory, also known as anti-globalists/traditionalists, they are of the view that globalization increases inequality amongst rich and poor people within the states, also marginalized states in the world economy and international markets. They consider it an old phenomenon and sees it largely as a myth or 'globaloney' and unjust. They hold a view that international economy has

---

and homogenization. In addition, Alvin Toffler in *Future Shock* (1970) and *The Third Wave* (1980) uses its different manifestation.

[3] Joan Edelman Spero, *Politics of International Economic Relations*, (New York, St. Martin Press, 1990), 13-18.

[4] Joseph Eugene Stiglitz, *Globalisation and Its discontents*, (London, Penguin, 2002), 3-22.

[5] South's North-South dialogue on economic vulnerabilities of developing and least developed states in UNCTAD compelled many Western scholars to accommodate the concerns of poor states in world economic structure and system.

[6] Joan Edelman Spero, *Politics of International Economic Relations*, (New York, St. Martin Press, 1990), 40-47.

not progressed enough to be global. Because there are states, where free trade will harm their domestic produce and foreign investments will exploit their poor workers (both developing and least developed states). In addition, it is not possible to create a uniform international economic system without undermining states' policies and affecting people.[7]

However, the post-skeptical transformationalists, third wave perspective, acknowledge that interdependence and integration of economies is occurring, and it is not only changing international economic system but also affecting national economies. They argue that long evolutionary process of closed and open economies will result into a hybrid economic culture, which will not be simple and linear or have similar gains for the least developed, developing or even developed economies.[8]Third wave transformationalists do not assert future trajectory of globalization, thus, they do not predict the impact of globalization, however, they observed that policies of globalised agencies (International Monetary Fund, World Bank, & World Trade Organization) benefitted some states and harmed others. In fact, they are more accommodating in comparison to hyperactive globalist, who perceives the ideal type of one world in terms of politics, economics, culture and nation without recognizing economic inequalities and disparities evolved by the corporate agendas. Transformationalists are also critics of radical anti-globalists, who are of the view that the present system is unjust, thus advocating for the abolishment of prevailing economic system. Transformationalists differ with anti-globalists on a view that the world community is static and is not moving towards new economic arrangements. Third wave perspectives acknowledge that changes are occurring and it is a long-term historical process with pre-modern forms, such as trade and movement of people amongst different regions. However, with progress in technological and other political changes in the 19th century, it has rapidly transformed the growth, volume and intensity of trade and other new things such as international economic and political organizations, global media communications and economic interdependence emerged.[9]

Transformationalists argue that for economic activities such as trade and investment, states' power as sovereign entity reconstituted to accommodate them in the world organizations, thus, for economic gains, states have become more activists, which is totally in opposition to both globalists and anti-globalists discourses. They are of the opinion that there is an uneven

---

[7] Chamsy el-Ojeili and Patrick Hayden, *Critical Theories of Globalisation*, (New York, Palgrave, Macmillan, 2006), 14-25.

[8] Paul Hirst and Graham Thompson, *Globalisation in Question,* (Cambridge, Polity Press, 1999), 22-30.

[9] Anthony McGrew, David Goldblatt, and David Held, *Global Transformations: Politics, Economics and Culture,* (US: Stanford University Press, 1999), 1-31.

integration, disparity and distribution of power, hence for survival in the regional blocs, nation-states adopt different possible activist strategies. They are also staunch critics of economic integration idea of the globalists that negate human needs and can have negative impact on social integration. For economic gains, social aspect should not be ignored. Although, they favor politics of cosmopolitan global democracy, however, they do recognize the inequalities and conflicts, which will obstruct global integration both at economic and political level. However, they believe that the nation states without compromising their sovereignty can control and manage its role in the global economic agencies.[10]

Third wave advocates observe that the globalists' approach is abstract, generalized, see globalised world only, while anti-globalists in their methods are empirical, and perceive world with clashes of the cultures, nation-state, tirade and inequality. While in defense of their views, transformationalists approach is qualitative, accept global transformation but with differentiation, and perceive no particular future or system.[11] The transformationalists generated the moderate debate on globalization; however, the idea of bringing reforms in the economic system is started by the dependency theorists.

Proponents of dependency theorists are closer to the third wave transformationalists, they along with the critique of globalists started questioning relationship between the rich and the poor states in the economic setup and developmental processes in the Third World. They observe and establish that the economic relations between poor and rich will always be asymmetrical, and the rich will dominate poor. Moreover, they also criticize both rich capitalists and communists states, even though both groups are supporting and practicing two different economic systems. They also challenge their developmental approaches in the South, stating that the strategy is for their own gains and political interest. Dependency theory argues that, "states and nations are integrated parts of one single political economy (trade, markets) but there is hierarchical division of labor, capital, resources and power".[12]

They classify states into core (developed/capitalists), semi-periphery (developing) and periphery (least developed). Defined core states more productive, govern and control economic system, which led to economic disparity and inequality amongst nations. Semi-periphery states (developing) are placed between the core and periphery, this group is manipulated by the

[10] Held et al. 1999, 1-31.
[11] Ibid.
[12] Sing, C. Chew and Robert A. Denemark, *Development of Underdevelopment: Essays in Honour of Andre Gunder Frank*, (New York, Sage Publications, 1996), 24- 40.

core states due to asymmetrical economic relations between them, while they (semi-periphery states) take advantage of periphery states due to some economic influence. In the economic arrangement, the periphery states (least developed) is dependent on both core and semi-periphery states due to their fragile economy. The dependency theorists discuss the division of states on the economic status and advocate for egalitarian international economic system but without any agreeable strategy.[13]

To further the arguments, the reformist dependistas accepts the views of dependency school of thought on inequality and disproportionate relationship amongst rich, middle and poor income economy states but they do not believe that only the economic structures are responsible for the present arrangements of the states. They are anti-core but not anti-capitalists as they are of the view that with structural reforms, the dependency and underdevelopment in the developing and least developed countries can be eradicated. They observe that some of the semi-peripheral and peripheral states with the comparative advantage have taken off and experienced a rapid economic growth.[14] Hence, instead of abolishing the prevailing system, reforms should be introduced to address the economic disparity and deprivation.

The proponents (North core states/capitalists) of globalization through structural explanation advocate that a liberal and free trade is an important component and lawful process for economic development. According to them, trade in the economy is recognized as a major tool or engine for economic growth and development. However, as dependistas and reformists argue that a connection between trade and development is multifaceted, therefore, there is no assurance that a trade or free trade will improve economic growth in all the countries. In the developing world, industrial and agricultural policies (to export more and import less) are to be framed in such manner that address the vulnerabilities and exploit the potential. In fact, all states need to frame policies that can protect their domestic production and industries. Therefore, it is observed that no state whether from poor South or rich North is ready to experiment with an absolute free and liberal trade.[15]

Presently, there are two contradictory trends at work in global trading patterns. One is towards integration of the industrialized and non-industrialized regions in super trade structure such as World Trade

[13] Sing & Robert 1996, 24- 40.
[14] Tamas Szentes, *The Transformation of the World Economy New Directions and New Interests*, (London, Zed Books Ltd. 1988), 12-22.
[15] Szentes. 1988, 12-22.

Organization (WTO)[16] and other is emerging potential division of the industrialized North and some developing South into competing trading blocs. Therefore, integrated (regional liberal/free trade) internally while closing its markets to other states/non-members. Intra- regionally, some pacts and free trade areas are established such as European Union, Economic Cooperation Organization and North American Free Trade Areas to facilitate trade amongst the member states.

WTO, a proponent of free trade in 1995 (General Agreement Trade Tariff final round held in Punta del Este, Uruguay, transformed agreement into WTO without bringing concrete reforms for semi-peripheral and peripheral states); became one of the important agency of globalization; advocating interdependence and integration of nations by eliminating social, cultural, economic borders and national economies through free trade. In this process of eliminating borders and integrating national economies, WTO through single undertaking is forcing every member state, irrespective of nature of its economy to accept all the agreements and policies.[17]

Developing nations of the South are also attracted to the WTO's trade liberalization, non-discriminatory and reciprocity policies without realizing their shortcomings and economic vulnerabilities. Moreover, many states of the South also had undergone through numerous economic changes in 1970s and 80s, some states became huge exporters (China and Brazil) and needed to be a part of some economic arrangements while others (India and Mexico) for economic growth, invited and encouraged foreign investment and multinationals. Thus, participation of the developing South (which has hardly 40 percent share in the world economy) in the economic institutions was inevitable as many complex issues associated with trade and commerce needed to be resolved. In addition, the fear of political and economic isolation by the capitalists' bloc also forced many developing states to join the new trade arrangement. Hence, due to economic compulsions and requirements, developing and least developed states including Pakistan and recently Afghanistan joined the WTO. Presently, 74% of the representation in the organization is from the developing and least developed states.[18]

WTO produces general rules and agreements that apply to all members and individual governments make specific commitments. However, in return, the member state cannot put-up demands for the organization to bend or reform rules. It is also observed that in WTO there is an absence of equally binding regulations in human rights, labor conditions, health and

[16] World Trade Publication, *Understanding WTO*, (Switzerland, Geneva, 2003), 4-28.
[17] Ibid.
[18] Constantine Michalopous, *Developing Countries in the WTO*, US, Palgrave & Macmillan 1999),117.

environmental protection, clearly indicating that it gives economic supremacy over social objectives. Its rules generally dictate redesigning of domestic laws, rules and regulations, to further policies that in turn subordinate domestic trade.[19] Its policies implement a broad array of non-trade related barriers to states' trade under its regulatory structures and approaches. It also challenges state's laws if they claim to pose barriers to international trade and investment. Thus, several policies of the organization have become controversial; in reality, recently many developing nations consider it a direct threat to their economies.[20]

As mentioned above, the global South's attraction and economic compulsions forced the majority of developing states to became a member of WTO, but in the beginning, many joined it without understanding the agenda of the North and its establishment. However, now some of its policies are so blatantly ruthless that it is overtly hurting the poor states and till to date none of the ministerial conferences of the WTO can be considered a complete success or without being protested by the South. The ongoing Doha Round is facing tough resistance on expanding free trade from developing states. The former Director General of WTO, Pascal Lamy, showed his concerns about the failure of the Doha Round that can even threaten the very existence of WTO.[21] Hence, since its inception, certain agreements are debated amongst the developed states as well in relation to free trade, competitive markets, environmental issues, the and labor standards problems but no consensus has been achieved on any of these problems.

While joining the WTO, many states of the South envisaged to achieve goals and objectives such as to develop cordial relations with the member states to facilitate the smooth functioning of trade and commerce, improve standards of living of their population by providing them opportunities through trade and commercial activities with other states. For developing states, the attracting clause was that by being a member of the WTO, they would gain access to the developed markets with special concessions. Moreover, it is not possible for any state to avoid the WTO, which is regulating more than ten trillion dollars trade amongst the world community.[22] In the process of joining the WTO, several states completely

---

[19] George Sores, *George Sores on Globalisation*, (New Delhi, Viva Books, 2004), 31-38.

[20] Ashu Pasricha, *W.T.O: Self-Reliance and Globalisation*, (New Delhi: Deep & Deep Publishers, 2005), 115-122.

[21] WTO News, *Speeches- DG Pascal Lamy*, retrieved from http://www.wto.org, accessed on 22nd April 2009.

[22] Christina L Davis and Sarah Blodgett Bermeo, Who Files? Developing Country Participation in GATT/WTO Adjudication, *The Journal of Politics*, 71/3, (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, July 2009), 55-59.

ignored the problems of such nations that are living in the most precarious economic conditions. In such a vulnerable group are the indigenous and tribal populations living on different peripheral areas.

Reservations of the Indigenous and Tribal People towards WTO Policies

There is a huge scholarship available on the indigenous and tribal people that are raising their voices against the WTO's implemented agreements and policies in their respective regions. They were already facing numerous problems at the hands of settlers and stakeholders in their areas but they are now confronted with another threat in the form of the WTO. Several groups lobbied for their rights in the International Labor Organization and United Nations, expressing their concerns regarding WTO and its agreements and policies. To them this global corporate entity is forcing states to open up their trade and commerce at the expense of several sub-nation's livelihoods.

In 1999, Victoria Tauli-Corpuz, director TEBTEBBA foundation (Indigenous Peoples' International Centre for Policy Research and Education), shared concerns about the WTO's policies in a "Human Face of Trade: Health and Environment" Peoples' Tribunal, published by the United Methodist Church in Seattle, Washington. She raised some very important issues, which WTO ignored while devising its agreements and policies. In criticism of WTO's Agreement on Agriculture, she stated that the major economic activity of the indigenous and tribal community is agriculture and they feel that through liberalization agenda, non-taxed cheap inorganic agriculture products will destroy the organic produce of traditional farmers.[23]

She pointed out that the policies of the World Bank, International Monetary Fund and World Trade Organization are identical, accusing them of investment without any barriers and acquiring access to cheap raw materials and labor. It was mentioned that the states are taking dictations from these financial institutions, thus, appropriating and opening up their (indigenous & tribal people) natural resources for investment and employment incentives". In many states, indigenous and tribal people are forced to leave their ancestral homes and many were persecuted. For example, in the Philippines, they were forced out of their homeland while in Bangladesh, tribal people were prosecuted.[24]

---

[23] Victoria Tauli-Corpuz, *Impacts of WTO on the Environment, Cultures and Indigenous Peoples*, (Seattle Washington 1999), 1-5. Retrieved from http://www.ratical.org/co-globalise/impactsOfWTO.html, accessed on 22 April 2014.

[24] Ibid.

In criticism of the Trade Related Intellectual Property Rights, it is observed from different cases that the agreement is protecting intellectual property rights of the developed states. In addition, the concerns were raised that the US, UK and Japan are stealing and patenting indigenous people's biogenetic resources without their knowledge. There are many plants grown and used by indigenous people that are now patented by these states, which disallows them to use or commercialize it as herbs. Many states, after stealing their knowledge and natural resources, use TRIPS as an excuse to stop indigenous people from practicing their centuries old usage and knowledge of natural resources.[25]

Due to such concerns and protests, indigenous and tribal people were invited to the 5 Ministerial Conference of WTO in 2003 at Cancun, Mexico. The invited panel discussed the problems of indigenous and tribal farmers that lost their farms and jobs as they failed to compete with cheap agriculture imports. They pointed out that Bolivia was asked to privatized its essential services like water and energy for the indigenous people under the pressure of WTO's GATS Agreement. They criticized the Trade Policy Review Mechanism Agreement which forces states to liberalize their investment laws and facilitate transnational mining, gas, and oil corporations. Due to their excavation and extraction activities, indigenous communities in Bangladesh, India, the Philippines, Indonesia, Nigeria, Ecuador, Papua New Guinea, Guyana, Venezuela, Colombia, Chad Cameron, the US, and Russia have suffered badly. In some states they are forced to leave their homelands, in others they have been persecuted and detained. Moreover, due to such activities, the environment of the areas is polluted and in some cases, sacred places of the indigenous and tribal people have been demolished.[26] During the conference, a tragic incidence occurred an activist and South Korean farmer Lee Kyung-Hae self-immolated himself in protest. Meanwhile, conference members from the developed, developing and least developed discussed trade liberalization and lack of agriculture support programs for poor communities. The issue of thousands indigenous farmers in Mexico, Guatemala, Colombia and Vietnam were also discussed although it was concluded without any consensus on reforms. The issue of indigenous populations with the WTO is a warning to other downtrodden communities too. It gives the impression that the WTO is a corporate body and has no consideration for the vulnerable indigenous and tribal people's identity, culture, habitat, environment, livelihood, and existence. There are no doubts that the WTO's agreements and policies, if not reformed, will prove detrimental for the war torn Pak- Afghan border tribes too. Hence, to argue

[25] Ibid.

[26] Ministerial Conference of WTO Cancun, *The International Declaration of Indigenous Peoples*, (Cancun 2003), 1-6. Retrieved from http://www.ifg.org/programs/indig/CancunDec.html, accessed on 22 April 2014.

the case of erstwhile FATA and adjacent five Afghan border provinces, I have borrowed both the transformationalists and reformist dependistas approaches. It argues against the globalist ideal stance of one integrated world without recognizing economic disparities in poor peripheries. Thus, it is advocating for reforms in the WTO's agreements to suit the needs of poor sub-nations and tribes.

WTO and Pak-Afghan Border Areas' Tribes

Pakistan (semi-peripheral) and Afghanistan (peripheral) in WTO are attracted to trade liberalization, non-discriminatory and reciprocity agreements and policies. After becoming members of the WTO, they have to abide by certain strenuous commitments such as reduction of trade obstacles, regulation of subsidies, countervailing measures and technical barriers, discouraging antidumping rules, abolishment of restrictive trade related to investment measures, devising transparent national policies and abiding by the dispute settlement procedure. Erstwhile FATA and adjacent five wilayatona are the periphery of Pakistan and Afghanistan in the global economic system. The Pakhtun border region (erstwhile FATA and adjacent Afghan five border provinces) total population is 8.7 million, average literacy rate among the tribes is hardly 15.5 percent, while the average per capita income of semi-skilled population is $225 and annual growth rate of the region is .1 percent to 1.5 percent. This places the region in the category of the periphery of the peripheral and semi-peripheral states.[27] This peripheral region (not only in terms of geography but economic health too) has poor agriculture and fragile manufacturing sectors, hence border tribes are dependent on trade for their livelihood.[28]

Table I Basic Information about Erstwhile FATA and Five Afghan Border Provinces/Wilayatona

Total population of border provinces	**8.7 million**
Border shared	**1400 miles**
Literacy rate (average)	**15.5 percent**
Per capita income	**$225**
Poverty index	**60 percent**
Annual growth rate	**0.1 to 1.5 percent**

[27] Dependency theorists classify states into; core (developed), semi-periphery (developing) and periphery (least developed).

[28] Government of Pakistan, *Province Wise Census*, (Government of Pakistan, Islamabad, 2017), 1-15. Retrieved from official website http://pbs.gov.pk accessed on 1 June 2018. Central Statistics Organisation, *Afghanistan's Socio Economic and Demographic Profile,* (Government of Afghanistan, Kabul 2014). Retrieved from C.S.O. http://cso.gov.af/en accessed on 22 April 2013. Its an official estimated population, however, according to many reports and articles is more than 9 million tribal Pakhtuns living across the border.

Unfortunately, border areas' resources and facilities are also limited and can hardly sustain the onslaught of any economic change or pressure. Ironically, WTO's regulations explicitly state that the policies and agreements signed by the members shall be extended and applied to every part of the state. In addition, there is no special concession or clause for the underdeveloped/least developed/periphery areas with-in a state. Therefore, it is observed that certain specific WTO agreements can prove detrimental to the poor tribes/sub-nations and will adversely affect their traditional agriculture, fragile industries, both formal and informal trade, labor and environment. Even if the WTO, through some mechanism, tried to extend special concessions for another decade or more, these border areas on both sides will still not be able to cope with its regulations. Both states do not possess the capacity and resources to improve the social and economic structures of their respective areas for the next three to four decades. Erstwhile FATA needs more than $75 billion annually for development and mainstreaming,[29] while in the case of the five Afghan border provinces, least developed Afghanistan needs huge funding for its progress and development in the core areas and then will be able to assist its border areas. If a state whose 71 percent of its budget is financed by external sources and funding and hardly .04 percent of the budget is allocated to its poor border provinces, then how will it compete in the WTO with other states and how will its sub-nations living on the periphery with no or minimum resources survive the onslaught of the WTO's policies?[30]

It is also very alarming to note that farmers and traders in rural areas of Pakistan and Afghanistan have no idea about the WTO and its binding agreements.[31] If they are not aware of such economic arrangements and policies, then how will they be able to improve or prepare themselves for economic changes? WTO is a corporate entity; its only consideration is profit and more profit, while border areas need a far more sensitive approach.[32]

---

[29] Ejaz Ahmed Qureshi, *Interim Report FATA REFORMS COMMISSION*, (Governors' Secretariat Peshawar, 2015), 43-68.

[30] Ministry of Finance, *National Budget Document 1394*, (Government of Afghanistan, Kabul 2015), 14-29.

[31] Interviews by the author with the officials in Islamabad that are working in the WTO Centre. Also, see Mary Kirkbride, *Getting the Fundamental Right: The Early Stages of Afghanistan's WTO Accession Process*, (UK, Oxfam Briefing Paper 2007), 1-42.

[32] Reforms should be introduced in WTO to accommodate the needs of poor states and impoverished sub-nations or else its policies will rob them of livelihood.

Impact of WTO's Agreement on Agriculture in Border Areas

The major economic activity in the erstwhile FATA and adjacent five Afghan border areas is agriculture. Almost 50 percent of the population is involved in agriculture-related activities such as farming, livestock rearing and dairy products. The land area utilised for agriculture in these border areas is less than 2 percent that supports on average 20 people per hectare,[33] while Pakistan's core areas land utilization is 25.2 percent and Afghanistan is 6.83 percent.[34] In comparison to the core areas of both states, these border areas' farmers are using centuries old farming tools and equipment, irrigation facilities are non-existent and no efforts are being taken by either government to improve them, thus huge areas of land due to such problems are not properly utilised. In addition, border areas are declared highly food insecure due to government's apathy, poor farming methods, underutilization of the land and security situation[35].

Table II. Pakistan-Afghanistan Core Area Land Utilization Percentages

Pakistan Core Areas Land Utilization	**25.2 percent**
Afghanistan Core Areas Land Utilization	**6.83 percent**
Pak-Afghan Border Areas Land Utilization	**2 percent**
Support Per Hectare	**20 persons**

Since 1995, following the WTO's Agreement on Agriculture, Pakistan has reduced custom duties from 65 percent to 25 percent on agricultural products. In addition, it imposed 15 percent of sales tax on domestic agriculture products and exempted seeds, while on imports of agricultural products, regulatory duty has been converted into fixed (minimum) specific duty. During 1995 to 2005, Pakistan reduced 40 percent of the domestic support to agriculture and livestock. In 1999-2000, subsidies on fertilizers, sugar, wheat, electricity, tube wells and other related sectors to agriculture were cut by 30 percent without the consideration of the farming community. [36] Afghanistan in the process of adopting Agreement on Agriculture will have to abide by the three major instruments of market

---

[33] Bureau of Statistics, *FATA* (Government of Pakistan, Peshawar, 2014, 37. Civil Secretariat FATA, *FATA Sustainable Development Plan 2007–2015,* (Government of Pakistan, Peshawar, 2005),]5. Central Statistics Organisation, *Afghanistan's Socio Economic and Demographic Profile* (Government of Afghanistan, Kabul, 2014). Retrieved from official website of C.S.O http://cso.gov.af/en, accessed on 20 July 2015.

[34] Ibid.

[35] World Food Programme Pakistan, *Rapid Needs Assessment Report of FATA*, (Islamabad 2012), 2-29. World Food Programme Afghanistan, *National Risk and Vulnerability Assessment, (*Kabul 2014), 4

[36] Anwar F Chishti, Waqar Malik and Mohammad Ghaffar Chaudry, WTO's Trade Liberalisation, Agriculture Growth and Poverty Alleviation in Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 40:4 Part II Winter, (Islamabad 2001), 1035-1036.

access, domestic support and export subsidy.[37] Implementations of such measures means Afghanistan will gain access to foreign markets but on the condition of reciprocity. The major concern is that Afghanistan's poor agriculture sector is in no position to provide domestic support (subsidized quality seeds, fertilizers, modern machinery etc.,) to its farmers.[38]

The WTO's Agreement on Agriculture aims at maximizing market access for agriculture products by lowering tariffs and converting non-tariff barriers into tariff ones, however supporting certain concessions and subsidies to local farmers.[39] As per the Agreement on Agriculture, low tariffs will give access to agriculture imports, consequently the local organic produce in border areas will face competition from cheap inorganic agriculture imports that might displace local production. As discussed above, that it is already happening in the case of many other tribal and indigenous communities. Hence, while it will not rob tribes from their major source of income but it will threaten their health and life with cheap inorganic fruits, vegetables and other edibles.

The poor farmer across the border is engaged in farming activities with his own available resources and without any subsidies on seeds, fertilizers and required safe pesticides. Therefore, due to lack of facilities and subsidies, farmers in the Pak-Afghan border areas have failed to grow enough wheat, rice and vegetables to fulfill the needs of their own population. Different World Food Program reports and surveys have declared Pak-Afghan border areas food insecure.[40] Many programs by the respective governments of Pakistan and Afghanistan were devised and launched in the past but existed only on papers and was never adopted in practice.[41]

---

[37] Micheal Holden, *Afghanistan: Economic Activity and Policy Challenges*, (Ottawa: Canadian Parliamentary Information and Research Service Publication PRB 07-29E 2008), 16- 22. The Afghan farmers interviewed by the author at Kabul in the year 2012.

[38] Afghan farmers interviewed by author in Kabul between years 2014 and 2015.

[39] For agriculture, there is no red box; hence, governments can provide subsidies in the agriculture sector. Developing and least developed states cannot give subsidies to its farmers. Thus, the Agreement on Agriculture can be disastrous for the agrarian economies of developing and least developed states. According to the WTO agreement, market forces should control agriculture policies rather than the concerned farmer community. This particular arrangement erodes the concept of farmer and food security.

[40] World Food Programme Pakistan, *Rapid Needs Assessment Report of FATA*, (Islamabad 2012), 2-29. World Food Programme Afghanistan, *National Risk and Vulnerability Assessment*, (Kabul 2014), 4.

[41] Bureau Report, "FIA given go-ahead to investigate FATA Secretariat corruption case", *Express Tribune* 16/4/2013, 4. Also, see Khan, M.M, "50 pc Fata officials corrupt, says PA", *The News International* 4 /8/2014, 7. Bertlesmann Stiftung, *BTI 2010 — Afghanistan Country Report*, (Gutersloh, Bertelsmann Stiftung, Germany 2009), 12.

Moreover, border area farmers have no idea or knowledge about the specific standards of the WTO's Agreement on Agriculture in terms of food safety, packaging, sanitizing and labeling. Even if they tried to use comparative advantage in certain organic products, they still would not be able to export them to international markets/developed markets due to lack of facilities and knowledge about the WTO's standards. Due to all such problems, the border tribes are not ready for the WTO's Agreement on Agriculture, it is important that both Pakistan and Afghanistan should devise policies that give preferential treatment to border areas' agriculture sector.

Impact of WTO's Agreements on Fragile Industries in Border Areas

The erstwhile FATA had several major industrial units of sports equipment, arms and ammunition, mining, cement, leather and tanning, woolen mills, edible oil, and match factories.[42] However, in 2002, many major units were closed down and now hardly 1815 medium and small-scale units are in working condition. On Afghanistan's side, approximately 100 medium and small-scale units are operating and fulfilling the needs of the local population.[43] On both sides of the border, there are several agro based small and medium cottage industries, providing employment to the semi-skilled tribes living there. In the Afghan border areas, mostly small-scale agriculture units such as dairy products, dry fruits, rugs, and carpets are providing employment and livelihood.[44] While in erstwhile FATA, there are medium and small-scale units of arms and ammunition, marble, brick making, furniture making, and textiles along with several agro-based cottage industries operating. These units on both sides were established with limited financial resources are using outdated machinery, employing semiskilled labor, and are sfacing long hours of power breakdown. To help these border tribes, in 2006, the US administration promised to set-up an economic program called the Reconstruction Opportunity Zone but it never materialized due to security concerns. Under this proposed program, several incentives were devised such as loans and tax breaks for investors, which would have helped in establishing and strengthening the industrial sectors of the border areas and would have prepared the industries for WTO's agreements.[45]

It is understandable that the implementation of WTO's agreements and regulations related to manufacturing and industries will be automatically extended to the border areas too. Ironically, Pakistan is a top reformer in the

[42] FATA Development Authority & CAMP, *Survey Enumeration of Industries, Labour Force and Identifying constrain in FATA*, (Peshawar, October 2010), 25-150.
[43] Afghanistan Statistical Yearbook, (Government of Afghanistan Kabul 2011), 119.
[44] Ibid.
[45] Ikram Sehgal, Border trade zone, *The News International*, 16/6/2011, 12.

region and 10th in the world regarding adjustment performance related to the WTO's agreements and regulations in the manufacturing sector. These reforms include relaxation in the rules to establish businesses, minimizing costs to register property, devising penalties for violating corporate governance rules and framing of convenient laws to acquire import and export licenses for traders.[46] In the process of liberalization and facilitation, Pakistan is adversely affecting its fragile manufacturing sector and infant industry at the core, and even the core areas' industrial sector is not ready to comply with the WTO's regulations. In case of the Afghanistan, industrial aid by donors is provided to the major cities. With foreign assistance, Afghans have been able to develop a few textiles industries of wool, cotton, carpets, and rugs. Presently, these industries accounts for 2 percent of Afghanistan's total GDP and engaging 10 percent of the labor force. However, these industries are only from the core areas and cities, peripheral areas do not contribute to it.[47] Nevertheless, Afghanistan, a new member of the WTO, is playing to the tune of its trade liberalization, that is "tax your local produce and allow every imports with no or nominal duty". Today Afghanistan's local produce has to pay 30 percent of taxes along with the electricity problem, red-tape system and land acquisition problems while imported commodities are taxed from 1 percent to 60 percent, which are encouraging foreign commodities with no or minimum trade barriers and harming Afghanistan's fragile manufacturing units.[48]

In border areas, there is a dearth of sufficient skilled human, capital, land, availability of funds, energy, and security issues. Hence, it is highly unlikely that better quality, high tech goods can be manufactured and will be able to compete in the international market. In fact, due to low tariffs, imports will replace the local goods and oust the local population of employment in the existing operational units. If Pakistan and Afghanistan succumbs to the policies of the WTO without adjustment at home, then poor and nominal industries of the border areas will be completely destroyed, which is providing employment to those tribes who refused to migrate from their villages.

---

[46] World Bank. *Doing Business in South Asia 2007: Pakistan is Runner-up Reformer in Region*; *Karachi has the country's most business-friendly regulations.* International Finance Corporation, Washington DC 2007, p.p. 6-27.

[47] United Nations Industrial Development Organisation, *Integrated Program of Cooperation between the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan and UNIDO 2009-2013*, (Government of Afghanistan, Kabul 2009), 1- 7.

[48] Bakhtyar Shahpur, *Foreign Imports Killing Off Afghan Industry*, (Institute For War & Peace Reporting, Afghanistan 2011), 9. Retrieved from http://iwpr.net/report-news/foreign-imports-killing-afghan-industry, accessed on 7 December 2014.

It is observed in the case of indigenous populations that states' start appropriating and opening up natural resources for (so -called) industrialization and employment incentives in the border areas, which results in hurting the local communities. There is a possibility that through a Trade Policy Review Mechanism agreement[49], Pakistan and Afghanistan, like others, would be forced to liberalize investment laws to facilitate transnational mining, gas and oil corporations in the mineral rich border region which might have serious consequences.

Impact of WTO's Agreements on Trade and Commerce in Border Areas

WTO's Trade Policy Review Body's major objective is to pave the way for regular consultations, reappraisal and liberalization of the trade policies of member states. Pakistan and Afghanistan's[50] governments are trying to liberalize trade. Both the states revised their transit trade agreement in 2010 (Afghanistan Pakistan Transit Trade Agreement) and formulated it to suit the WTO's policies. However, in this ambitious process, they have completely ignored the troubled and impoverished border areas tribes' trade. Pakistan and Afghanistan's formal bilateral trade is worth 2.3 billion dollars and 34 percent (2.10 billion dollars) of the Afghan transit commodities pass through erstwhile FATA, thus involving tribesmen in trade related services and provide livelihood to 1 million people.[51]

Table III Annual exports of Pakistan to Afghanistan

	Goods & Commodities	**Value in millions $**	**Pk.Imp.dut**	**Afgh. Exp. duty**
1.	Salt, sulphur, earth (fuller clay), stone, plaster, lime & cement	127	1% - 10%	1%-5%

[49] The major objective of TPRM is to review members' economic policies and make sure that they adhere to the rules and commitments made under Multilateral and Plurilateral Trade Agreements. It states that no member shall apply any measures that discriminate against foreigners and foreign products.

[50] Recently Afghanistan is elevated to full member of WTO from an observer state and, thus, it is in the process of introducing economic reforms to adjust to WTO agreements related to trade and tariff.

[51] Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, *Trade Annual Report 2013-14*, (Islamabad 2014). Afghanistan National Statistics Organisation, *Import and Export of Afghanistan, (*Kabul, 2014). Also, see Najeeb R Abbasi, *Afghanistan- Pakistan Transit Trade Agreement 2010*, (Peshawar, Pakistan Customs 2013), 3.

2.	Sugar confectionery	56	10% - 15%	2.5%-10%
3.	Milled products (wheat, corn etc.), malts(germinated cereal), starches, wheat gluten	42	10% - 25%	5%-10%
4.	Animal, vegetable fats & oils	34	10% to 15%	5%-10%
5.	Processed food & fresh food products	50	5% to 15%	1%-20%

Table IV Annual Exports of Afghanistan to Pakistan

	Goods and Commodities	**Value in million $**	**Afgh.Exp.duty**	**Pk.Imp.duty**
1.	Mineral fuels, oils, distillation products for crude oil	56	10%-25%	5%-10%
2.	Iron &steel (scrap)	42	5%	1%-10%
3.	Edible fresh fruit & nuts	34	2.5% to 15%	10%-20%
4.	Edible vegetables, certain roots&tubers	25	2.5% to 5%	10%-25%
5.	Cotton, apparel, rugs & carpets	127	1% to 10%	20%-40%

Both states are members of the World Custom Organization (WCO);[52] however, either of them has signed the Custom Valuation Code, thus implementing import values according to their states' needs. Pakistan applies tariff and custom duties from 60 to 150 percent on some of the commodities such as luxury items and electronics according to commodity value evaluation and some on weight. Afghanistan applies the lowest duties i.e., 1 to 60 percent, on almost all kinds of commodities (food, beverages,

[52] This organisation formed in Brussels in 1952 as Custom Cooperation Council and later transformed into World Custom Organisation (WCO), its task is harmonisation and approximation of tariff among the trading communities of WTO. The WCO has devised a mechanism of codes system for goods and commodities. For details see Wolffgang, M.H. Emerging Issues In European Custom Law. *World Custom Journal* Vol. 1, No. 1. Australia: International Network of Customs Universities (INCU) 2007, p. 5.

luxury items, electronics, and vehicles) using evaluation of goods on weight and value.[53] Due to the above difference of custom duties, most of the goods are re-exported to Pakistan's settled markets through border areas. However, the elimination of custom duties and taxes on imported goods as per WTO's agreements will adversely affect all kinds of trade happening on the border. Many tribesmen are involved in transit cum informal trade and earning profits. Three tiers of organizations are involved in the transit cum informal trade, at the top is importing commodities from different parts of world, second is the middle man who carries these goods across the border and the third party is re-exporting it back to Pakistan, involving 1 million people from both sides. If taxes and tariffs are completely abolished, the profit of 8 –120 percent (1 billion dollars) earned by the border areas' traders on both sides through transit cum informal trade will diminish, destroying markets developed over the last three decades, and would be robbing thousands of people of jobs and other economic opportunities.[54] In this process of trade liberalization, the second and third tier trader of the border areas will be adversely affected, especially the small shopkeepers selling tax-free goods worth $2.10 billion. Several major markets in the seven Agencies and six Frontier Regions, comprising approximately 50,000 retail shops dealing with goods and commodities, exchanged through formal, informal and transit trade will also be drastically affected.[55] An official report of the FATA Secretariat states that there are approximately 15,000 major shops that sell goods (formal, informal and transit), engaging more than 50,000 people from erstwhile FATA and adjacent areas. Karkhano market near Peshawar has more than 2,000 shops that engage more than 10,000 people from the border areas and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Similarly, Frontier Regions adjacent to every tribal district has 7,000 shops in FR[56] Peshawar, FR Kohat, FR Bannu, FR Tank, FR Lakki Marwat and FR DI Khan that is the source of livelihood for many people.[57] Recently, women are also seen on the roads of Peshawar, travelling from Karkhano market to the settled districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and transporting goods on motorcycle pull carts.[58] If WTO's

[53] Notifications by Islamic Republic of Afghanistan Ministry of Finance Customs and Revenues and Ministry of Commerce Pakistan. These notifications are issues every year to change the tariff and custom duties.

[54] Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, *Trade Annual Report 2013-14*, (Islamabad, 2014). Afghanistan National Statistics Organisation, *Import and Export of Afghanistan, (*Kabul 2014).

[55] Custom Collector Najib-ur-Rehman Abbasi and Custom Officer Herat Abdus Saboor interviewed by the author at the Custom House Peshawar in 2013.

[56] Frontier Regions located at the confluence settled district of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and erstwhile FATA.

[57] FATA Secretariat, *Summary Policy Paper 2014,* (Peshawar 2015), 12-16.

[58] See The News International clips and reports on women traders involved in transit trade. I have personally seen these women and interacted with them on Peshawar University road too.

agreements such as Multilateral Agreement on Trade in Goods, also known as General Agreement on Tariff and Trade for free trade (zero taxes and duties), is enacted then it will rob the border tribes of profits earned by the spillover of transit commodities into settled areas through informal/illicit trade. It will have serious consequences for border tribes if some policy is not introduced to adjust the people involved in transit trade and informal trade. See the table V for fuller understanding of profits earned by the tribes through the transit trade.

Table V Difference of Commodities Prices in Informal Markets of Erstwhile FATA and State Regulated Markets and its Economic impact on Border Tribes Food Commodities

No	Commodities	Price in Border Areas Pk. Rs.	Price in State Regulated Market Pk. Rs	Price Difference and Profit
1.	Ghee/Oil 5kg.	410-570	600-750	39%
2.	Tea 1kg.	150-200	475-550	195%
3.	Coffee 1kg.	270-300	400-475	53%
4.	Green tea 1kg.	140-145	200-250	58%
5.	Biscuits dozen	180-200	250-300	41.4%
6.	Beverages 5kg	450-500	550-600	21.1%
7.	Jam/Jelly bottle 300 ml.	120-125	150-175	32.5%
8.	Honey bottle ml.	150-160	270-300	83.7%
9.	Pickles bottle ml.	100-120	120-130	14%
10.	Spices/1kg	200-250	300-350	45%
11.	Dry Fruits/1kg	500-1000	700-1800	60%
12.	Butter 250 gm.	100-120	125-140	20.5%

Electronics

No.	Commodities	Price in Border Markets	Price in State Regulated Market	Price Difference
1	T.V (21-32 inches) LCD/LED(46-55 inches)	10,000-22,000 45000-70,000	20,000-44,000/65000-100,000	100%
2	Refrigerator(small/large)	10,000-40,000	15,000-55,000	43.7%
3	Washing machine	17,000-25,000	20,000-30,000	18.8%
4	Sewing machine	2,300-2,500	2,500-3,000	14.3%
5	Vacuum cleaner	4,000-7,000	5,000-8,000	19.5%
6	Air conditioner AC splits (1/2 ton)	12,000-23,000	20,000-30,000	48.5%
7	Video camera	10,000-15,000	15,000-20,000	41.6%
8	Digital camera	9,000-15,000	15,000-22,000	56.6%
9	VCP/VCR	6,000-10,000	10,000-15,000	58.3%
10	VCD/DVD	1,500- 3,000	2,500-5,000	66.6%
11	Telephone	500-3,000	1,000-5,000	83.3%
12	Fax machine	8,000-10,000	10,000-15,000	37.5%
13	Iron	1,300-2,200	1,500-2,500	14.4%
14	Iron rod	500-1,200	700-1,500	32.5%
15	Electric juicer/grinder	1,400-3,500	2,000-4,500	35.5%
16	Microwave	7,000-22,000	10,000-30,000	39.7%
17	Toaster/sandwich maker	2,200-3,000	2,700-4,500	36.3%
18	Electric kettle	1,700-2,200	2,500-4,000	64.4%
19	Electric shaving machine	500-1,200	900-2,000	73.3%

Household and Luxury Items

No	Commodities	Price In FATA Market	Price In State Regulated Market	Price Difference
1	Sweater/Jacket	400-1,000	800-1,500	75%
2	Unstitched cloth	1,200-2,000	1,800-2,800	45%
3	Gents Suiting material	2,000-5,000	3,500-8,000	67.5%
4	Shoes ladies/gents)	600-1,000	1,000-2,200	93.3%
5	Blanket (single/double)	1,200-2,200	1,800-3,300	50%
6	Carpets	2,000-10,000	5,000-20,000	125%
7	Crockery/crystals (tea/dinner sets)	12,000-25,000	20,000-45,000	73.3%
8	Toiletries (medium soap/ toothpaste/ shampoo)	50/75-120	70/120-200	55.5%
9	Cosmetics (body sprays/ perfumes)	80-500	135-1,200	101.2%
10	Cigarettes (dozen)	360-500	700-1,200	117.2%

Other Heavy Machinery

No.	Commodities	Price in Border Areas Markets	Price in State Regulated Market	Price Difference
1.	Generator	18000-90,000	25,000-100,000	24.9%
2.	U.P.S.	5,000-12,000	8,000-20,000	63.3%
3.	Rechargeable lights/ Torches	150-2000	300-2,800	70%
4.	Vehicle spare parts	2,000-50,000	4,000-80,000	80%
5.	Vehicles (only used in FATA, can't sell it in settled areas)	400,000-100,0000 (from 800 cc to 1300 cc)	100,0000-250,0000 Rs	Benefit FATA only

Pakistan Tribal Areas and Adjacent Afghan Border Areas and WTO Social Clause

The non-tariff barrier Social Clause is a conditionality attached to the exports of developing and least developing countries. As in the rest of Pakistan, in erstwhile FATA, Pakistan labor laws and mechanisms to protect labor rights are absent.[59] Therefore, labor engaged in different sectors is under-paid and without any cover for life and job security. However, in Afghanistan, the National Labor Policy was adopted in 2012.[60] It has been extended to border wilayats too but the government failed to implement it due to incapacity and lack of proper structures. In border areas, the majority of women and children -- although they are underpaid but support families with their meager income -- are engaged in various sectors such as agriculture, carpet making, textile embroidery, leather goods, wood and stone carving, brick making, jewelry making, and trade. Most of male children are actively participating in trade and transit trade by carrying goods across the border on donkeys, pull carts and on their backs. Different newspapers also reported that some women are also carrying goods for trade across the Pak-Afghan border and into Peshawar city.[61]

According to limited official data available on child labor, in erstwhile FATA, 17.1 percent children aged 5 to 14[62] and in Afghan border provinces, 20 percent children aged 5 to 17 are working in different sectors as laborers and support their families.[63] Both the Pakistan and Afghanistan governments do not have the financial strength or will to stop the violation of labor laws and child labor in their respective states and border areas. If WTO's Social Clause is applied to these border areas, it will not only put a stop to fragile economic activities at the borderland but will also affect the underage labor that is supporting families for food, shelter and protection. The underage labor is forced and helpless, as the state has completely ignored the plight of many affected by conflict and poverty. In an ideal situation, grants coming for erstwhile FATA and adjacent border areas should be invested in these areas' children and women.

[59] FATA Social and Welfare Department at Peshawar deals with labour and other welfare issues but no structural mechanism in FATA is present to deal with labour rights violations. In addition, recently announced to launch a child protection policy but it is yet to be implemented.

[60] Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, *National Labour Policy,(*Kabul, 2013), 2-7. This law deals with issue of child labour too.

[61] Nabi Jan of Tribal Network Peshawar interviewed by the author on 2 February 2015.

[62] FATA Secretariat, *Child Protection Policy Report, (*Peshawar 2015), 8.

[63] US Department of Labour, *Child Labour in Afghanistan*, (Washington DC, 2008), 88-97.

By protecting women and children under the Social Clause without any proper strategy such as forcing both states under different UN conventions, international trading communities will involuntarily threaten the livelihood of the border tribes. These areas are poor, lack resources to meet international labor standards, and are struggling to survive. However, if WTO regulations are enacted then Social Clause will also be a part of several agreements, although people living in such underdeveloped peripheral areas cannot afford the luxuries of those sitting in the 'green room' and living in developed societies.

Conclusion

Afghanistan and Pakistan are pressurized by the phenomenon of globalization. Thus, to be a part of the "global village," Afghanistan and Pakistan are involved in intense reforms in agriculture, industry and trade (APPTA 2010) to suit the wishes of globalized agency WTO. Unfortunately, both Pakistan and Afghanistan, like many agrarian economies, have failed to provide support and subsidies to their agriculture sectors as prescribed by the WTO. It is also a paradox, as in many developing states, agriculture exports, outputs, wages, and profit have failed to reduce poverty in their respective states. Thus, both states started experimentation with industrialization and privatization policies and ignored the agriculture sector. Afghanistan instead diverted its maximum foreign funds and loans to building its security apparatus due to massive security concerns. For Afghanistan, it is mandatory to reform its economy (without considering her vulnerabilities) to gain membership, and Pakistan (being a member) is under pressure from WTO to implement the organization's agreements. In this process of adjusting their domestic economies with WTO's policies, both governments are ignoring their fragile economies and above all the sub-nations living in the conflict ridden Pak-Afghan border region.

It is so ironic that many developing and least developed states cannot afford even a team at Geneva to defend their economic interest in the WTO. The whole procedure devised by the organization is too expensive and cumbersome. Afghanistan, with no resources and no representatives, will be at a serious disadvantage if there is any dispute or any issue that is needed to be heard or handled at the WTO. This corporate entity is also using non-tariff barriers such as Social Clause and environmental issues to stop access of Afghanistan and Pakistan's commodities to international markets, robbing them of exports and their population of jobs while flooding and dumping markets with cheap global goods and commodities.

In the economic scheme of arrangements, border areas are the periphery of poor states that needs to adopt a sensitive approach towards impoverished and war- torn regions. Indigenous and tribal people of other states have

already expressed and recorded the adverse effects of WTO's agreements on their communities at the ILO, UN and WTO. Therefore, if the WTO fails to introduce humane reforms to accommodate impoverished and war-torn border areas and tribes, then it will trample all the values, cultures, environment, and human dignity inherent within these communities.

Bibliography

Abbasi, Najeeb-ur-Rehman. *Afghanistan- Pakistan Transit Trade Agreement 2010*. Peshawar: Pakistan Customs, 2012.

Afghanistan Statistical Yearbook. *Import and Export of Afghanistan*. Government of Afghanistan: Kabul, 2010.

Bureau of Statistics. FATA Cell. *Important Agency/FR wise Socio-Economic Indicators of FATA*. Government of Pakistan: Peshawar, 2014.

Bureau Report. FIA given go-ahead to investigate FATA Secretariat corruption case. *Express Tribune*, 2013.

Central Statistics Organization. *Afghanistan's Socio Economic and Demographic Profile.* Government of Afghanistan: Kabul, 2013. Retrieved from http://cso.gov.af/en accessed on 22 April 2013.

Civil Secretariat FATA. *FATA Sustainable Development Plan 2007–2015*. Government of Pakistan, Peshawar 2005.

FATA Development Authority & CAMP. *Survey Enumeration of Industries, Labor Force and Identifying constrain in FATA*. Government of Pakistan: Peshawar, 2010.

FATA Secretariat. *Child Protection Policy Report.* Government of Pakistan: Peshawar, 2015.

FATA Secretariat. *Summary Policy Paper 2014.* Government of Pakistan: Peshawar, 2015.

Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan. *National Labor Policy*. Government of Afghanistan: Kabul 2013.

Khan, M. 50 pc Fata officials corrupt, says PA, *The News International.* 2014.

Kirkbride, Mary. *Getting the Fundamental Right: The Early Stages of Afghanistan's WTO Accession Process*, UK: Oxfam Briefing Paper 2007.

Ministerial Conference of WTO. *The International Declaration of Indigenous Peoples*. Cancun, 2003. Retrieved from http://www.ifg.org/programs/indig/CancunDec.html, accessed on 22 April 2014.

Ministry of Finance. *National Budget Document 1394*. Government of Afghanistan: Kabul 2015.

Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. *Trade Annual Report 2013-14*. Government of Pakistan: Islamabad 2014.

Qureshi, Ejaz Ahmed. *Interim Report FATA REFORMS COMMISSION*, Governors' Secretariat Peshawar, 2015.

Sehgal, Ikram. Border trade zone, *The News International.* Islamabad, 2011.

South Asia Joint Planning Group Report. *Joint Strategic Oversight Plan for Afghanistan 2015*. Washington DC 2016.

Stiftung, Bertelsmann. *BTI 2010 — Afghanistan Country Report*. Gutersloh: Bertelsmann Stiftung, Germany, 2009.

Tauli-Corpuz, Victoria. *Impacts of WTO on the Environment, Cultures and Indigenous Peoples*. US, 1999. Retrieved from http://www.ratical.org/co-globalise/impactsOfWTO.html, accessed on 22 April 2014.

US Department of Labor. *Child Labor in Afghanistan*. Washington DC, 2008.

World Bank. *Poverty Status in Afghanistan: A Profile based on National Risk and Vulnerability Assessment (NRVA).*Washington DC, 2008.

World Food Program Afghanistan. *National Risk and Vulnerability Assessment.* Government of Afghanistan: Kabul 2008.

World Food Program Pakistan. *Rapid Needs Assessment Report of FATA*. Islamabad 2012.

Central Asia Journal No. 81, Winter 2017

PESHAWAR UNIVERSITY CAMPUS LIBRARIES, TREASURY OF CENTRAL ASIAN MANUSCRIPTS

Abdul Haseeb [*] ***& Saeed Ullah Jan*** [**]

Introduction

The cultural and literary heritage of a nation can be found in their writings.[1] Moreover, the development of art, science and literature can be assessed historically through the use of these writing available in manuscript form.[2] They throw enough light on the times in which they were written. It is a record of the knowledge, aesthetic literary and creative skill of the period in which they were written. Manuscripts are therefore essentially thought to be the most important element in tracing on the human heritage.[3]

Since earlier knowledge along with religion came to this part of the world through Central Asia, therefore most rather all such records are available in the prevailing languages of the time like Arabic, Persian, Turkish or Pashto.[4]

The University Campus[5] at Peshawar is a conglomeration center of knowledge. Emerging with Islamia College in the early part of the last century, it had by now grown into four universities with couple of dozen institutions. The manuscript repositories amongst them are mainly Islamia

[*] Presently serving as Assistant Librarian, University of Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan
[**] Presently serving as Chairman, Department of Library and Information Science, Khushal Khan Khattak University, Karak, KP, Pakistan
[1] Anwar Khan, Central Asian Manuscripts in Pakistan. *The Times*, 15th February 1976
[2] Abdul Haseeb, *A Case Study of Islamia College Library,* Unpublished M.A Thesis. (Peshawar: Department of Library and Information Science, University of Peshawar, 2001-02): 64
[3]Muhammad Fida., *Central Asian Manuscripts in Peshawar*, Unpublished Ph.D. research dissertation, p 14
[4] S. Munawar, *History of Writings*. (Karachi: Unique Publishing, 1986): 25-28
[5]University Campus includes Peshawar University, Islamia College University, Engineering University, Agricultural University and Khyber Medical College

College (now university) and the University of Peshawar[6]. They contain, to my assessment, some of the rarest collections on socio-scientific knowledge besides religion and ethics. The total number of manuscripts in the Islamia College Library is twelve hundred and seventy[7]. This rare collection has been donated by Ghulam Jillani and his family soon after the establishment of the college library[8]. Center Library University of Peshawar also contains some of the rare manuscripts on different subjects[9]. Maximum number of manuscripts among these has been donated by Ghulam Samdani. The total number of this collection is seven hundred and twelve. Pashto Academy library is another place of manuscripts collection on the campus having more than nine hundred manuscript collection mostly donated by Ghulam Samdani[10].

Literature Review

A comprehensive review of the relevant literature has been made in order to understand the research problem in the first phase of this research. Manuscripts related studies were comprehensively reviewed to understand different aspects of manuscripts. To meet the scope of the study, different literatures were searched in published and unpublished form.

1 Abdur Rahim Kulachvi, former-Librarian, Islamia College Peshawar, prepared a three column descriptive list of manuscripts in two volumes, entitled "*Lubab-al-Maarif al-Ilmiyah"*, in a book form, highlighting importance of manuscripts in Islamia College Peshawars Library in 1917, containing 452 total number of manuscripts were 1261, it is in Urdu language.[11]

2 Abdul Hamid another former-Librarian, Islamia College Peshawar, prepared a eight column descriptive list of manuscripts in two volumes, entitled "Al-Musami Ba-Lubab-ul-Marif-ul-Ilmia-Fe-Maktabah Darul Uloom Al Islamia Peshawar" in 1998, containing 1321, highlighting the Importance of those manuscripts which are related to religion, in Urdu language.[12]

---

[6] Khan, A., Central Asian Manuscripts in Pakistan. *The Times*, (15th February 1976)
[7] Abdur Rahim Kulachvi, *Lubab-al-Maarif al-Ilmiyah*, (Peshawar, 1971): 9
[8] Ibid.
[9] An Interview with late Dr. Arif Naseem, writer / Historian, on 4th January, 2013
[10] An Interview with Mr. Farooq, son of Sayed Fazal Samdani, donor of manuscripts to Univresity of Peshawar and Pashtu Academy, university of Peshawar, on 19th May, 2013
[11] Abdur Rahim Kulachvi, *Lubab-al-Maarif al-Ilmiyah*. (Peshawar, 1971): 9
[12] Abdul Hamid, *Al-Musami Ba-Lubab-ul-Marif-ul-Ilmia-Fe-Maktabah Dar-ul-Uloom Al Islamia Peshawar*. Unpublished M.Phil. Thesis (Peshawar: University of Peshawar, Peshawar, 1998)

3 Nasim Fatima a well known archivist of Sindh, former chairperson Department of Library & Information Sciences, University of Karachi, now principal Investigator in the Department of Archives conducted her research work entitled "Standardizing & Cataloguing of Urdu Manuscripts" at Karachi university in 1992, having not more than 670 pages, published in 2010. Various cataloguing codes are used, with 14 column description. She also formulated some cataloguing rules to standardize Urdu manuscripts.[13]

4 Muhammad Ismail, Assistant Professor, Department of Library and Information Sciences, University of Peshawar in his M.Phil. work entitled "Archival Material on Central Asia in the Directorate of Archives, Peshawar" in one volume at Area Study Center Peshawar in 2006, having 221 number of pages, it is a descriptive Subject catalogue with 8 column description, restricted only to concerned files of the Archives Department covering the period from 1849 to 1947, some of the files were summarized and compiled, while without any specific reason most of the files has been left.[14]

5 "Research Studies of Libraries & Archival Record in Directorate of Sindh Archives" PhD research work by Shamshad Ahmad, currently assistant professor in Islamia University Bahawalpur in 2008, having 474 pages, supervised by Nasim Fatima. It is a descriptive catalogue in one volume having 15 column descriptions, arranged chronologically; an index is also given at the end. He also tried to trace out the path of manuscripts, and pointed different problems faced during the preparation of catalogue.[15]

6 Unpublished PhD research work at Department of Library and Information Sciences, University of Sindh by Nisar Ahmad Subhputo entitled, "A Comparative Studies of Provincial Archivist in Pakistan, their Impact on History, Culture and Research Activities in 2005 contains not more than 424 pages. It is a subject catalogue, in one volume, with 12 column description. It is an attempt made to establish Archives as the state property and to provide them legislative protection. It is a comparative study

[13]Naseem Fatima, *Standardizing & Cataloguing of Urdu Manuscript.* (Karachi: University of Karachi, 1992)

[14]Mohammad Ismail, *Archival Material on Central Asia in the Directorate of Archives, Peshawar,* Unpublished M.Phil. Thesis, Area Study Centre, University of Peshawar, Peshawar 2006

[15]Shamshad Ahmad, *Research Studies of Libraries & Archival Record in Directorate of Sindh Archives,* Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, (Jamshoro: University of Sindh, 2008)

of four Provincial Directorates of Archives, including building, staff, preservation system, budget and readers.[16]

Justification

The study will not only enable the library professionals to use it as a source of reference and a tool for access but will also generate a new sense in the future investigation in the related field of manuscripts. The study will explore the descriptive information about the manuscripts, which will be further use for the preparation of subject catalogue.

Objectives of the Study

1. To provide data for preparing subject catalogue of rarest the manuscripts.
2. To create descriptive metadata of the manuscripts.
3. To trace out new areas of research on manuscripts.

Limitation of the Study

The research study shall be limited to the manuscripts related to Central Asia or manuscripts written by Central Asian scholars available in the libraries of University of Peshawar, Islamia college university Peshawar Furthermore, manuscripts which are related to Pure Sciences, Applied Sciences and Social Sciences written in four different languages those are Arabic, Persian, Urdu and Pashtu.

Research Methodology

To proceed with the problem, demarcated lines are required to tackle the problem. In this connection, historical (documentary) and survey research methods are mostly applicable. However, other methods will also be used to strengthen the techniques of data collection for more accurate results. The study will also be based on descriptive research method.

Findings

After the collection of data related to 117 manuscripts from the sample libraries it was properly organized, tabulated, analyzed and interpreted. Percentage and frequency were concluded through Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) software.

---

[16]Nisar Ahmad Subhputo, *A Comparative Study of Provincial Archivist in Pakistan, their Impact on History, Culture and Research Activities*, Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, (Jamshoro: University of Sindh, 2005)

Institute Name	Frequency	Percent
Islamia College University Peshawar	65	55.6
Central Library, University of Peshawar	41	35.0
Library, Pashto Academy	11	9.4
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 1

Ownership of Manuscripts

The research results show the ownership of the manuscripts available within the sample libraries of public sector universities in Peshawar on the campus. The collected data confirm that among the total 117 manuscripts 65 (55.6 %) manuscripts are available in Islamia College, University, Peshawar followed by Central Library, University of Peshawar in 41 (35.0 %). The Library of Pashto Academy, University of Peshawar, is having least number that is 11 (9.4 %) of the existing manuscripts within the libraries. Table 1 highlights the summary of this data.

Subject	Frequency	Percent
Medical Sc	54	46.2
Philosophy	34	29.1
Veterinary Sciences	6	5.1
Astronomy	12	10.3
Mathematics	8	6.8
Physics	2	1.7
Chemistry	1	.9
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 2

Subject of Manuscript

It has been analyzed that that among the total 117 manuscripts available in the libraries on university campus 54 (46.2 %) of the manuscripts are on the subject of Medical sciences, followed by the subject of Philosophy with 34 (29.1 %), while 12 (10.3 %) of the manuscripts on the subject of Astronomy, however 08 (6.8 %) on the subject of Mathematics and 06 (5.1 %) of the manuscripts on Veterinary Sciences. The study further evaluated that 02 (1.7 %) of the manuscripts on the subject of Physics, and 1 (0.9 %) had the least manuscripts on the subject of Chemistry. Summary of the subject-wise analysis are given in table 2.

Language	Frequency	Percent
Arabic	77	65.8
Persian	31	26.5
Others	9	7.7
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 3

Language of the Manuscript

The languages of the manuscripts are Arabic, Persian and others languages. Others include manuscripts on the languages of Pashto, Hindko and Turkic.

The result shows that the majority of the 77 (65.8 %) of the manuscripts are written in Arabic language and 31 (26.5 %) manuscripts inscribed in the language of the Persian. It is pertinent to mention that only 9 (7.7 %) of the manuscripts are written in other languages. Detailed summary is shown in table 3.

Ink used	Frequency	Percent
Black Color	72	61.5
Red & Black	36	30.8
Others	9	7.7
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 4

Ink Used

It has been examined that different colors of ink are used while writing the understudy manuscripts. Which are Black Color, Red & Black and other colors, i.e. mix colors like Black, Blue, Red and Golden.

The result shows that in most of the manuscripts 72 (61.5 %) Black color ink is used, followed by 36 (30.8 %) manuscripts in Red & Black color ink. Manuscripts in another color ink are 9 (7.7 %). The Details of this analysis are given in the table 4.

Types of Binding	Frequency	Percent
Leather binding	67	57.3
Hard binding	37	31.6
Others	13	11.1
Total	117	100.0

Table 5

Binding of Manuscripts

The binding of the manuscripts has been examined and the results show that three different kinds of binding which are Leather, Hard binding and others. Others include manuscripts without binding that is without binding.

The result demonstrates that more than half of manuscripts, i.e., 67 (57.3 %) are in leather binding while 37 (40.2 %) manuscripts have hard binding. However, a very least number 13 (11.1 %) of manuscripts hasanother type of binding these includes manuscripts without any proper bindings.

Color of Leather Binding	Frequency	Percent
Red Color Leather	34	29.1
Black Color Leather	18	15.4
Others	15	12.8
Total	67	57.3
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 6

Color of Leather Binding

Different colors of leather bindings have been used in those binding which are bound with leather, these colors include Red, Black, and others. Other includes a mixture of, red and black, red, black and blue, red black blue and golden bindings. The majority of the leather bindings is in red color 34 (29.1 %) black color is for 18 (15.4%) while 15 (12.8 %) for others among the total 67 leather binding manuscripts. Tables 6 shows 50 (42.7%) missing numbers which are for those manuscripts which are not leather binding manuscripts.

Style of Writing	Frequency	Percent
Nastaleeq	68	58.1
Naskh	39	33.3
Other	10	8.5
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 7

Style of Writing

The writing style of the manuscripts was also examined. These manuscripts are written in different styles like Nastaleeq, Naskh and other styles that include the combination of Nastaleeq and Naskh.

The result shows that 68 (58.1%) manuscripts were written in Nastaleeq followed by 39 (33.3 %) manuscripts, writing style was Naskh while 10 (8.5 %) were in other styles. Table 7 shows the frequency and percentage of these styles.

Condition	Frequency	Percent
Good	72	61.5
Fair	32	27.4
Poor	13	11.1
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 8

Condition of Manuscript

The manuscripts available in the public sector universities on the campus are very old and precious. Through evaluation of the manuscripts, it has been examined the physical condition of these manuscripts. The condition of the manuscripts was divided into three different options like good, fair and poor.

The calculated result shows that the majority of the manuscripts, i.e., 72 (61.5 %) is in good condition, while 32 (27.4 %) manuscripts were in fair condition. However 13 (11.1 %) manuscripts were in poor condition. The detail is given in table 8.

Paper Color	Frequency	Percent
Light Brown	72	61.5
Half White	45	38.5
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 9

Manuscript Paper Color

Different colors of paper have been used for writing these manuscripts a large number of half brown\ brown 72(61.5%) paper was used while 45(38.5%) manuscripts are written on half white\white color papers. Table 9 shows the results regarding the color of the papers.

Status	Frequency	Percent
Complete	91	77.8
Incomplete	26	22.2
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 10

Status of Manuscript

This study also investigated the status of manuscripts available in the University libraries on the campus. The researcher had set two options, complete and other is incomplete manuscripts.

The results regarding the status of manuscripts show that 91 (77.8%) of the manuscripts were completed in all respects, whereas 26 (22.2%) were incomplete (some pages are missing while in some volume 1 is available but the other is not available etc.). A detail summary regarding the status of manuscripts can be viewed in table 10.

Number of Pages	Frequency	Percent
More than 200	59	50.4
101-200	31	26.5
1-100	27	23.1
Total	**117**	**100.0**

Table 11

Number of Pages in Manuscript:

Table 11 presents that the total number of pages available in the manuscripts which exist in the public sector universities on campus. It has been divided into three groups of pagination. These groups are: 1-100, 101-200 and more than 200 pages.

The result illustrates that the majority of 58 (49.6%) of the manuscripts having more than 200 pages. It is pertinent to mention that 31 (26.5 %) of the manuscripts have found in the pagination of 101-200. It was found that 28 (23.9 %) of the manuscripts having 1-100 pages.

Manuscripts' Languages Institution Wise

Institutions	Languages			
	Arabic	**Persian**	**Others**	**Total**
Islamia college Peshawar	48	16	01	65
Central library ,University of Peshawar	29	12	0	41
Pashto Academy ,University of Peshawar	0	03	08	11

Table 12

Manuscripts' Languages Institution Wise:

As per the calculated data, a large number of Arabic manuscripts 77 are present in the sample libraries. Islamia college, university library poses the largest number 48 followed by Central Library, University of Peshawar having 29 manuscripts in Arabic language. Persian language comes second after Arabic language with a total number of 31 manuscripts. The Islamia College, University has the largest number in Persian language by having 16 manuscripts while 12 manuscripts in the said language are at Central library university of Peshawar. Three (3) manuscripts in Persian language are recorded in Pashto Academy, University of Peshawar library. Apart from Arabic and Persian language manuscripts 09 manuscripts are in other languages such as Pashto, Hindko and Turkic. Table 12 indicates the calculated figures.

Manuscripts' Color of Paper Institutions Wise

Institutions	Colors		
	Light Brown/ Brown	**Half White/White**	**Total**
Islamia college Peshawar	46	19	65
Central library ,University of Peshawar	21	20	41
Pashto Academy, University of Peshawar	05	06	11

Table 13

Manuscripts' Color of Paper Institutions Wise

Different colors of paper have been used while writing these 117 manuscripts such as light brown\brown half white \white. A large number of manuscripts in total 72 manuscripts are written on light brown\ brown paper followed by half white \white 45 manuscripts.

The Islamia College, University library is having 46 manuscripts in light brown \ brown color paper while Central Library, University of Peshawar library 21 and 05 manuscripts in the said color paper in Pashto Academy university of Peshawar.

Nineteen (19) manuscripts in half white \ white color are present in Islamia College, University Library. Central Library, University of Peshawar 20 and Pashto Academy, University of Peshawar Library is having 06 manuscripts in half white \ white color.

Conclusion

Muslim scientists contributed a great deal in various branches of sciences, such as mathematics, astronomy, medicine, animal sciences and others; all made gigantic strides during the glorious period of Muslim civilization. A large number of manuscripts on these subjects are available on the campus, written both in Arabic and Persian though a large number of them have been later printed particularly in India. Many important manuscripts are in versified form. Equally important are commentaries and glosses on them. Some of these manuscripts of the 12th / 13th century A.D are pieces of work of art.

Islamia College Peshawar, Central Library, University of Peshawar and Pashto Academy, University of Peshawar, possess perhaps the finest collection of manuscripts in the country. These works are of great historical importance in terms of their topics, calligraphic handwriting and can rightly be called treasure of knowledge.[17]

The Islamia college library is in possession of one of the finest and richest collection of manuscripts in the country. Some of the manuscripts and books are so rare that these are not available anywhere. Hakim Ajmal Khan during his visit to the Islamia College termed this collection as DURR-E-NAYAB. As per the results of the data collected it has been analyzed that the manuscripts available within the three sampled libraries (Islamia

[17] Abdul Haseeb, *A Case Study of Islamia College Library*, Unpublished M.A Thesis. (Peshawar: Department of Library and Information Science, University of Peshawar, 2001-02): 63

College, university, Library, Central Library, University, of Peshawar and Pashto Academy Library, University of Peshawar) are having some of the valuable manuscripts available throughout the world on the basis of their rareness. Another finding is that some of the manuscripts are so rare that they may not be found anywhere else. The importance of these manuscripts can also be judged on the basis of their subjects and the information they contain.

Bibliography

Ahmad, S., *Research Studies of Libraries & Archival Record in Directorate of Sindh Archives,* Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, 2008

Fatima, N., *Standardizing & Cataloguing Of Urdu Manuscript.* Karachi: University of Karachi, 1992

Fida, M., *Central Asian Manuscripts in Peshawar*. Unpulished Ph.D. research dissertation

Hamid, A., *Al-Musami Ba-Lubab-ul-Marif-ul-Ilmia-Fe-Maktabah Dar-ul-Uloom Al Islamia Peshawar.* Unpublished M.Phil. Thesis. Peshawar: University of Peshawar, 1998

Haseeb, A., *A Case Study of Islamia College Library*, Unpublished M.A Thesis. Peshawar: Department of Library and Information Science, University of Peshawar, 2002

Ismail, M., *Archival Material on Central Asia in the Directorate of Archives, Peshawar,* Unpublished M.Phil. Thesis. Peshawar: Area Study Centre, University of Peshawar, 2006

Khan, A., Central Asian Manuscripts in Pakistan. *The Times*, 15th February 1976

Kulachvi, A.R., *Lubab-al-Maarif al-Ilmiyah*. Peshawar, 1971

Munawar. S. History of Writings. Karachi: Unique Publishing, 1986

Subhputo, N. A., *A Comparative Study of Provincial Archivist in Pakistan, their Impact on History, Culture and Research Activities,* Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, 2005

Central Asia Journal No. 81, Winter 2017

CONCEPTUAL METAPHORS FOR LIFE IN PASHTO

Imran Khan [*] ***& Shuja Ahmad*** [Ψ]

Abstract

This paper, using Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT) as theoretical framework attempts to identify, analyze and interpret Metaphors for life in Pashto language. It argues that since life is a very rich conceptual domain, therefore it has more than one conceptual mapping. It identifies eight conceptual metaphors for Life in Pashto speech community, and demonstrates through mapping and entailment that how the target domain life is understood through several source domains in the Pashto language and culture. The identified metaphors for life are: Life is a Food, Life is a Journey, Life is a Person, Life is a Container, Life is Music, Life is a Burdon, Life is a Gamble and Life is a Trial.

Keywords: Conceptual Metaphor Theory, Cognitive Linguistics, Life, Target domain, Source Domain, Pashto Language and Culture.

Introduction

Metaphor, inherent in our conceptual system, is understanding one kind of thing in terms of another[1]. This study attempts to identify and interpret conceptual metaphors for life in Pashto (پښتو) language and culture. Pashto language belongs to the Indo-Iranian branch of Indo-European languages[2].It is the official language of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan along with Dari (Afghan Persian). Pashto language is also spoken by majority of the population in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Baluchistan provinces of Pakistan as their mother tongue. Pashto is also spoken in the northeast of Iran, Tajikistan and India, United Arab Emirates (UAE), and Saudi Arabia.

---

[*] Research Scholar, Area Study Centre, University of Peshawar.
[Ψ] Presently serving as Assistant Professor, Department of Philosophy, University of Peshawar.

[1]George Lakoff and Mark Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1980): 5

[2]Tariq Rahman, "Pashto Language & Identity Formation in Pakistan."*Contemporary South Asia,(4)2,* (1995): 151-170

CMT proposes that cross-domain mapping govern our conceptual system. The mapping take place on conceptual level in such a way that one conceptual domain is understood in terms of another conceptual domain.[3] A Conceptual domain represents an organized knowledge about an experience. In CMT, the conceptual domains have specific names, the target domain and the source domain. Target domain is an understanding of a less delineated conceptual domain through metaphorical expressions. Source domain is a more delineated conceptual domain used for understanding the target domain.[4] For instance, LIFE IS A PURPOSEFUL JOURNEY metaphor consists of the target domain, life, and source domain, journey.

The paper is purposefully divided into four secessions. The first secession introduces the CMT. The second secession delineates the methodology. The third secession identifies and interprets eight metaphors for life in Pashto language and culture. Other metaphors for life also exist besides the listed metaphors (Ref Unpublished MPhil thesis of Imran available in the Library of Area Study Center- University of Peshawar)[5]. The last secession concludes the discussion.

Methodology

The study applies Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT) proposed by Lakoff and Johnson in their works Metaphors We live By and Philosophy in the Flesh and elsewhere. Moreover, it utilizes their mappings method applied to source and target domains to establish a conceptual metaphor. The following method of CMT was applied.

The Identification of Metaphorical Linguistic Expression

The identification of linguistic metaphorical expression consists of two main steps: the first step involve a close reading or careful listening of the sources with the intention of finding potential metaphorical linguistic expression. The second step is the scrutiny of the potential metaphorical linguistic expressions with respect to the following selection criteria:

A metaphorical linguistic expression is any expression involving a separate source domains. A source domain is more delineated, detailed, and concrete that refers to a concept expressed through using a word, phrase or personification. Normally such linguistic items refer to something that is

---

[3]George Lakoff, "The Contemporary Theory of Metaphor" In *Metaphor and Thought*, ed. Andrew Ortony (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993): 202-251

[4]Zolthan Kovecses, *Metaphor: A practical introduction*,(New York: Oxford University Press. 2010): 4

[5] Imran Khan, *Conceptual Metaphors for Life in English and Pashto.*(M. Phil. Thesis, Area Study Centre Russia, China, Central Asia & Afghanistan, University of Peshawar, 2017)

concrete. Personification is the process of referring to a concept by using a word or phrase that generally denotes a living being. In cognitive linguistics, personification based metaphorical expressions are considered as a type of ontological metaphorical expressions.

For instance, **خا لي ژوند** (*empty* Life*)* is marked as a metaphorical expression because the word "**خا لي***"* (*empty)* normally collocates with physical containers such as **خا لي پيا لى**(*empty* cup), but the adjective *"***خا لي***"* (*empty*) is here used for the abstract noun "***ژوند***" (Life). Similarly the phrase, ***ستړي ژوند*** is marked as a personification of Life because *"****ستړي****"* (*weary*) usually collocates with living beings. Here, it is used for the abstract concept of Life.

Once the selected metaphorical expression passed the above-described criteria they were arranged under specific conceptual metaphors such as in the case **خا لي ژوند** (*empty* Life*)* the expression was arranged under conceptual metaphors LIFE IS A CONTAINER, and ***ستړي ژوند*** (*Weary* Life) was arranged under the conceptual metaphor LIFE IS LIVING BEING/PERSON. Pashto Metaphorical linguistic expressions were represented by bold and letters in each sentence.

Sources of Pashto Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions and Conceptual Metaphors for Life

Pashto dictionaries, both print and online, Pashto newspapers and literary texts, movies, songs, television and radio programs, research journals, magazines, autobiographies, proverbs, and tapa were utilized as source for selecting Pashto linguistic metaphorical expressions. On the one hand, it is assumed that dictionaries are records of the lexicon of a language collected by professional lexicographers who organize a consistent and rich source of everyday expressions. On the other hand, newspapers, literary texts, movies, songs, television and radio programs, research journals, magazines, autobiographies, songs, proverbs and tapa provide access to the collection of naturally occurring data pertaining to linguistic expression.

Metaphors For Life In Pashto

Conceptual metaphors for Life in Pashto as identified and interpreted by the study are as follows:

ژوند د خوراک يو څيز دي

3.1 Life is a Food

One of the conceptual understandings of life in Pashto language is that Life is a Food/ eatable thing.

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions -

او د بیلتانۀ د ژوندنوی نوی ***خوندونه***واخلی - [6]...
وائی د چا چې کمبختی وی په ***حلوا کښې ئې ازغے***وی - [7]
هغه د ژوند د ***خوږواو ترخو***نه نۀ دے خبر.
هغه ژوند ***خورلے***دے
دلته ژوند ***پیکه سیکه***دے
دلته ژوند در په دیکه دے
دلته ژوند دے دیر ***بې خونده***دے - [8]
چې په ژوند کښې سخته نه وي
لکه ***بې مالکي طعام***[9]

The Life-As-Food Mapping

Life corresponds to food.
The eating of food corresponds to living life.
The eater corresponds to the person who lives life.
Tasty food corresponds to happy/enjoyable/good life and
Sweet food corresponds to good life.
Bitter food or tasteless food corresponds to undesirable/unhappy/sad life.
Finishing food corresponds to end of life.

The Life-As-Food Entailment

Since food is a thing that gives either good taste or bad taste, life's experiences can be good or bad.
Food is enjoyed; life is appreciated.
Instead of only one food we prefer and enjoy various types of foods; routine life becomes boring so in order to enjoy life we want to have various experiences.
Sweet and tasty foods give pleasure; good experiences in life give pleasure and entertainment.
Bitter or tasteless foods don't give us pleasure; bad experiences in life deprive us of pleasure and happiness.

---

[6]Inam Ullah Jan Qais, *زړۀ کۀ دماغ (Trans. Heart or Brain),* (Peshawar: University Book Agency, 1999),50
[7]Roshan Bangash, *چونګ له خروارہ* (Trans. Selection from a Large quantity), 1st,2nd,3rd ed.(Peshawar: University Publishers Qissa Khwani, 2014), 148
[8]Salim Raz, *ژوند لمحه لمحه قتلیږم*(Trans./Being Killed Every Moment), (Peshawar: Master Printers, Jangi Mohalla, 2009),.55
[9]*لټون: د غني کلیا ت، نوي کلام (Search: Anthology of Ghani Khan's New Poetry)*4th ed.(Peshawar: University Book Agency, 2014), 476

If someone has tasted sweet and bitter food then one knows both the tastes; one having both good and bad experiences knows both sides of the life- experienced or seasoned person
Food gets finished; life ends.

ژوند یو سفر دي

3.2 Life is a Journey

The metaphor for life that is present in most of the languages is Life is a Journey. It is also present in Pashto language. Consider the following expressions:

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

د هغهٔ ژوند ***سفر*** کوم چې هغهٔ په ۱۹۲۴ کښې ***شورو***کړي وو، په ۲۶ دسمبر ۲۰۰۸ کښې خپل ***منزل ته ورسېدو***۔[10]
هغه ***بې لارې***شوې دي ۔
له وادهٔ نه پس ښځه او خاوند دواړه د ژوند ***نوې سفر*** پیل کوي۔[11]
خدای دي هغهٔ ته ***د نېغې لارې*** هدایت وکړي !
د دنیا زندګي ډېره مختصره ده ۔ زمونږ دنیا ته *راتلل* د یو ***مسافر***په شان دي ۔ ځنګه چې یو مسافر خپل **منزل**ته ځي نو هغهٔ په یو ځای کښې **دمه**اوکړي او بیا **خپل منزل**ته روان شي ۔
ځهٔ په ***یو ځنګل کښې ورک شوے*** یمه ماته د یو **آقا**ضرورت دے او د هغه په خبرو به ماته ځومره خوشحالي حاصله شی ۔[12]
خدائے دے د د هغوئي خپل زامن په ***بده لاره سم کړی***، ځوک چې د بل چا بچیانو ته (***بده لارهښئ***[13]
کوهی مهٔ کنهد بل سی ***په لارکښې***
چې ستا به د ***کوهیې غاړه لار*** شي ۔[14]
هرې خوا نه مې ***لارے بنْد دی*** ۔[15]
په دوۂ بېړوپښې مهٔ پرده[16]
چې ځوک *بل ته* ***کنده‌کنې*** نو خپله پکښې ***پریوځي*** ۔[17]

---

[10]Muflis Durani, *د صحا فت با با حاجي ګل کرم* (Trans. The Father of Pashto Journalism)*"* In*پښتون(Pukhtoon Magazine), 4(3)*,(Peshawar: Bacha Khan Trust, March 2009), 52-54
[11]Ezzat.(2011), *زوجینو حقوق*د ښځې او خاوند (Trans. Rights of husband and wife). http://www.quranawsunnat.com/?p=3109
Retrieved on 20/4/ 2014.
[12]Inam Ullah Jan Qais, *زړۂ کۂ دماغ (Trans. Heart or Brain)*, (Peshawar: University Book Agency, 1999),113
[13]Roshan Bangash, *چونګ له خروارہ* (Trans. Selection from a Large quantity), 1st,2nd,3rd ed.(Peshawar: University Publishers Qissa Khwani, 2014), 30
[14] Ibid 43
[15] Ibid 78
[16]Farhad Ali Wasim Yousafzay, *متلونو په لار*۔(Trans. On the Path of Proverbs),(Peshawar: Aamir Print And Publishers, 2014),119

د تارکولو په **سړک ځمه** پښې ابله
ژوندسفر دے د **هار تکنه غرمه** کښې ۔ [18]

The Life-As-Journey Mapping

Journey corresponds to life.
Destination/stops correspond to life goal and achievements.
Traveler corresponds to human
Weather condition corresponds to degree of harshness.
Different roads correspond to different choices.
Impediments to travel correspond to difficulties in life.
End of journey corresponds to end of life.

The Life-As-Journey Entailment

Since journey has a starting point, life has a starting point that is birth of human.
Since journey requires a traveler reaching a destination, life is led by human having aims, objectives, purposes and goals.
Journey requires a specific rout to reach certain destination; life aims and goals can be achieved by doing certain activities.
People can lose their way during journey; life aims and goals remain unachievable by engaging in something different.
Co-travelers have common destination; people can have common life goals.
A leader shows the path to traveler; parents, councilor and political leader guide people towards achieving certain life goals.
A traveler can face impediment during travel; a person leading life can face difficulties in life.
Harsh weather makes the journey difficult; certain degree of difficulties can make achieving life goals difficult.
Choosing a rout; choosing an option.
Different routes lead to different destination; different life options lead to different goals.

ژوند یو نفر/انسان دي

3.3 Life is a Person

The following linguistic expressions reveal that one of the life metaphors in Pashto language is that Life is a Person.

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

زما پلار ډېر ***نا قلاره*** ژوند تېر کړي دي

---

[17] Ibid. 204
[18] Salim Raz,*ژہ لمحہ لمحہ قتلیرم*(Trans.Being Killed Every Moment), (Peshawar: Master Printers, JangiMohalla, 2009),25

ژوند ډېر په ***منډه دی ۔***
زما مور زما د پلار ټولې سختۍ په چپه خله برداشت کړې دي ۔ او ډېر ***خاموش*** ژوند ئې
تېر کړو ۔
دلته ژوند ***در په دیکه دے ۔***
دژوندسره ډېره ***مینه*** مکوي ځکه ***ژوند*** دچاسره ***وفاته کوي***
دلته ژوندون خو بس ***سلګۍ وهي*** تل[19]
د ژوندون په مړۍ ناسته ده خپسه ۔
۔ ۔ ۔نه ***د ژوند وجود کښې ساه*** شته[20]

The Life-As-Person Mapping

Person corresponds to life
Good health of person corresponds to good life
Killing of person corresponds to ending life
Crying and sobbing of person corresponds to unhappy life
Tiredness of person corresponds to disappointment in life
Indifference of a person corresponds to uninteresting life
Crucifying person corresponds to difficulties in life
Disloyalty of person corresponds to uncertainty about life

The Life-As-Person Entailment

Since a person has physical existence, life has existence

A person with good heath enjoys happy life; Wealth and good experiences make life enjoyable.

Persons give us grief and sorrow; life gives us grief and sorrows.

A person gets tired while doing tasks; people get disappointed after unfruitful struggle for achieving life goals.

A person challenging established norms gets crucified; struggling for a good life people face substantial difficult and threatening situations.

An Indifferent person dissociate himself from a situation; people stop taking interest in achieving life goals

Disloyal person is perceived as unpredictable person and she can stop returning love any moment, life is uncertain and one can cease to exist due to unpredictable celestial and terrestrial calamities.

---

[19]Salim Raz, *ژړۍ لمحه لمحه قتلیږم*(Trans./Being Killed Every Moment), (Peshawar: Master Printers, Jangi Mohalla, 2009),47
[20] Ibid 6

3.4 Life is a Container

ژوند یو لوبنې دي -

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

د خاوند د مرګ نه پس د هغے ***ژوند کښې څهٔ پاتے نه*** شو-
هر انسان ته ***د پوره پوره ژوند*** تېرولو حق دي -
زما د مور ***ژوند د غمونو ډک*** ؤو -
د خوشحالو ډک ژوند درته غواړم!

The Life-As-Container Mapping

Container corresponds to life
Content in the container corresponds to the degree of emotions and feelings such as happiness and sadness.
Full container corresponds to high degree of emotions and feelings
Empty container corresponds to absence of emotions and feelings
Using the full container to the end corresponds to living a good natural life.

The Life-As-Container Entailment

Since container exists, life exists
Container has content, life has good and bad experiences that causes good and bad emotions and feelings
When container is full it contains greater content, life has experiences that causes high degree of good or bad emotions
When container is empty it has nothing in it, life is meaningless when one losses important people or things in life.
When the content of a container are totally used it is well used, when one spends life having all sorts of experiences and dies a natural death, it is considered good life.

ژوند سرود/ موسیقي ده

3.5 Life is Music

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

ابشارونه ***د ژوند زیرو بم*** ښکاره شی تر دے چه د خیالونو دنیا کښے څهٔ ډیر لرے لاړ ...
[21]شی - او د جذباتو ویره لمن کښے د قدرت منظرونه راتولول شروع کړی -
د غم سازونه دې وو چې ږل -
ځی ***د زړه په تار د ژوندون*** مستي ***نغمې وچې ږئ***
غږېږه د ښکلا کښې ذکر څه له د اجل کوئ[22]

[21]Inam Ullah Jan Qais, *زړۂ کۂ دماغ (Trans. Heart or Brain)*, (Peshawar: University Book Agency, 1999), 112

ژوندون څۀ دے؟ ***يو ساز دے غږيږي***
کله پوست، کله زير، کله بم
کله اور سوزېدۀ، شور او غوغا شي
کله غلے، قلار، شومه دم
کله شرنګ دبنګړو شي خمار شي
کله يخ اسوېلی او ماتم
کله تال مستانه د خيام شي ۔ [23]

The Life-As-Music Mapping

Music corresponds to life
Musical instrument corresponds to cause of life events
Rise of melody corresponds to good life events
Fall of melody corresponds to bad life events
Singer corresponds to the person living a life
Singing happy songs corresponds to happy life
Singing sad songs corresponds to unhappy life

The Life-As-Music Entailment

Since music exists, life exists
Various melodies are caused by musical instrument; external forces in life cause various events
Melodies rise, life has good events by virtue of UP IS GOOD metaphor[24]
Melodies fall; life has bad events by virtue of DOWN IS BAD metaphor[25]
Singer sings happy songs, life is happy
Singer sings sad songs, life is unhappy

---

[22]Salim Raz, *ژړۀ لمحه لمحه قتليږم*(Trans./Being Killed Every Moment), (Peshawar: Master Printers, JangiMohalla, 2009),54
[23]*لټون: د غني کليا ت، نوی کلام*(*Search: Anthology of Ghani Khan's New Poetry)*4th ed. (Peshawar: University Book Agency, 2014),48

[24]George Lakoff and Mark Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By*,(Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1980), 15
[25]Ibid

ژوند یو بوج/ پېټي دي

3.6 Life is a Burden

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

دژوند ***درنې*** *سختي نو ر ي* نه شم***اوړي!***
هر *انسان د ژوند* ***پټي*** په سر کړي دي او خپل منزل ته روان دي ـ
د غریب سړي***ژوند***د هغه***په اوږو بار*** وي ـ
د ګنو اولاد پالنه د هغه په ***نا توا نا اوږو لوي بار دي ـ***
د خپل وجود په***ناتوانه اوږو***
...یو ***ستر*** بربنډ لغړ او ***درونده لاش***
...ستړے ستومانه شومه...
لکه سخت ***درونده بار***...
لاش د***ژوندون ګرځوم***[26]

The Life-As-Burden Mapping

Weight corresponds to life

To carry weight corresponds to living disappointed life

Getting rid of weight corresponds to become hopeful and free of despair and emotional stress.

The Life-As-Burden Entailment

To carry weight requires great effort and stamina, to live a life with despair takes a lot of energy and effort.

Weight makes people tired after sometime; people get disappointed after doing a fruitless activity and stop struggle.

When people get rid of weight they feel relaxed, when people get out of despair they feel hopeful and happy.

ژوندیوه جواري ده

3.7 Life is a Gamble

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

د عزت بائې للل هېڅ شان زغملی نه شو دسرونو ***تاوان*** سره بلدیو...[27]
دحکومت دبي غوري له امله د ناظمانو سیاسی او سماجی ***مستقبل په داؤ لګولي شوے دے ـ***[28]

---

[26]Salim Raz, *ژۀ لمحه لمحه قتلیږم*(Trans./Being Killed Every Moment), (Peshawar: Master Printers, JangiMohalla, 2009), 75

[27]Ikram Uddin Mafton, هرکلی ته دار/ (Welcoming Death), https://incubator.wikimedia.org/wiki/Wb/ps/%D8%AF%D8%A7%D8%B1_%D8%AA%D9%87_%D9%87%D8%B1%DA%A9%D9%84%DB%8C Retrieved on 25/1/2018

[28] Khyber News, کراچی جلسه پی تی ائی اوایم کیوایم مک مکا وه: سعد رفیق (Trans. Karachi Public Gathering was PTI's Deal with MQM) http://www.khybernews.tv/pashto/newsDetails.php?cat=19&key=NjU5Mjg= Retrieved on 125/1/2017

دا کوم غوبل چي احدي، کرزي، اشرف غني، جلالي ..... او نورو کانديدانو جوړ کړي ***دا صرف ددي ويده ملت د دوکه کولو او غولولو يو چال دي***،[29]..
دا دَ هغه ***چال دے***. ـ
يکه يي خَان سره ساتلي ده.
هغه ډېر ***چال باز*** دے.
ژوند ته په شاته شاته ګورم
لکه ***بانډيلے جوارګر*** چي کور ته ځينه ـ

The Life-As- Gamble Mapping

Gambling corresponds to life.
Gambler corresponds to the person living life.
Gamblers correspond to people in a society involved in activities such as keeping relationships, playing sports, politics etc.
Losing in gamble corresponds to losing something important such as life, honor etc.
Moves in gamble correspond to strategies applied to win a life competition.
Losing everything in gamble corresponds to complete failure in life.
Winning gamble corresponds to success.

The Life-As- Gamble Entailment

Since gamble require gambler, life require person.
Since gamble requires other gamblers, life requires people as competitors.
Since gamble has risk, life has risks.
Since gambler loses assets or money, people loses life, honor etc.
Sometime gambler loses everything; sometime people fail completely doing a risky business or an activity.
Gambler sometime wins, people achieve success doing risky tasks.
Gamble require good moves to win, life require skill to take part in risky tasks to complete them.

ژوندیو مقدمه ده

3.8 Life is a Trial

[29]Nasiri.زهر کي شاتو که انتخابات (Trans; Elections or Poisoned honey) http://www.benawa.com/pashto/print.php?id=24014 Retried 22/1/2018

One of the conceptual understandings of life in Pashto language is that Life is a trial. This metaphor is greatly influenced by religious discourse.

Metaphorical Linguistic Expressions

د قیامت په ورځ به ټول انسانان ***خدائے ته حاضر وی*** ۔ او د هغوی د اعمالو حصاب کتاب به ورسره کوی ۔ او خپله ***فیصله*** به ورته ***اوروی*** ۔

خدائی پاک لوئی انصاف کوونکي دي ۔

د قیامت په ورځ به ***خدائی پاک*** *ته به د خپل بدو اعمالو څخه* ***جواب ورکوي ۔***

د پیغمبر په خبرو عمل زمونږ د پاره ***د خلاصی سبب*** دي ۔

قیامت په روځ به زمونږ ***اندامونه*** په مونږ ***گواهي*** کوي ۔

د حضور پاک د غوره او ښو اخلاقو یوه داسي نمونه دنیا ته وښودله چي هغه تر قیامته پوري د راتلونکو انسانانو د پاره د تقلید کولو جوګه او د هغوي د ***خلاصي*** وسیله ده ۔ [30]

The Life-As-Trial Mapping

Trial corresponds to life

Witness in trial corresponds to bad action in life. (According to religious discourse in Pashto language and culture, it is believed that our organs such as hands, eyes etc., would be witnesses to our bad actions, and they would speak about our wrong doings on the Day of Judgment)

Public prosecutors or lawyers corresponds to Prophets, sages, wise people and political leaders

Judge corresponds to God

Judgment day corresponds to Dooms day

Criminals corresponds to sinners

Punishment of criminals corresponds to punishment of sinners.

The Life-As-Trial Entailment

Since trial has a specific period, life has a specific period.

Since trial requires witnesses to the crime, our bad actions cannot be kept hidden and our organs such as hands, eyes and ear would be witness to our sins.

Since lawyer defend their clients, prophets, sages, wise men and political leaders defend people and advise them not to engage in bad actions.

Since trial requires a judge, people will face God as judge of their life actions in after life.

Decision of a trail is announced on judgment day, God will decide about good and bad actions of people on doomsday.

Judge punish criminals, God punish sinners.

---

[30] *اپینټو (اتم جماعت د پاره)* (Trans. Pashto Text Book for Class 8tt), (Peshawar: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Text Book Board, 2017), 18

Discussion and Conclusion

Section 3.1 shows that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain food such as *خوندونه/ tastes*, *حلوا کښې ئې ازغے/thorn in the pudding*, *خوږو/ sweetness او ترخو/ bitterness*, *خوند/ relish*, *پیکه سیکه/tasteless*, *بې خونده/ tasteless*, *بې مالکی طعام/food without salt* were mapped onto target domain life. Hence, life is understood as food. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as food is an ontological metaphor that highlights qualitative aspect of life while hides other aspects of life such as purpose etc.

Section 3.2 indicates that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain journey such as*سمی/straight*, *کږی /zigzag*, *لار /path*, *ټیغی/straight*, *سفر/journey*, *پیل کوي /start*,*تیښتے /escape*, *مخے/in front*, *لارو/paths*, *غلطو/wrong*, *مسافر /traveler*, *منزل /destination*,*ځنګل /forest*, *هدف /destination*,*هدفونه/destinations*,*بده /wrong*,*سم/corrects*, *کوهی / well of water*, *غاړه/towards*,*بند closed*, *لوټکیو/lost*, *رهبر /guide*, *په دوۀ/two*, *ډیږو/boats*, *پښې /do not stand*, *کندو/pits*, *سر یې/travel*,*کنده /ditch*, *کنې/dig*, *پریوځي/fall into*, *ټکرو/stumbles*, *ځایې/place*,*راځي /reaches*, *غر/mountain*,*سر/top*, *لار/path*, *سړک/road*, *ځمه /walk*, *قدم/steps*, *زنځیرونه/shackles*, *رهزنان/robbers*, *لاره درسره ده/on the way with you*, *رسیدۀ reached*, *تللۍ journey*, *یو په مخه / on a straight path* were mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as journey is a structural metaphor that highlights the purpose and progress aspect of life while hides other aspects of life such as quality etc. at the same time. Life as journey metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life is a purposeful activity.

Section 3.3 demonstrates that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain person such as *نا قلاره / restless*, *منده / run*, *خاموش / silent*, *بېزاره / fed-up*, *په دیکه / stumbling*, *healthy / روغ*, *life / ژوند*, *Love / مینه*, *loyalty / وفا*, *offers / وړاند یز*, *tired / مړه پستری /killed*, *سلګی وهي / sobbing*, *وجود کښې ساه/breath in the body*, *مری / throat*, *مصلوب / Crucified, executed, killed*, were mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as person is an ontological metaphor that highlights the qualitative aspect of life while hides other aspects of life such as purpose at the same time. Life as person metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life as a qualitative entity.

Section 3.4 exhibits that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain container such as*شو نه پاتے ځۀ/empty*, *پوره/ full/ complete*, *ډک / full* was mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as container is an ontological metaphor that highlights the qualitative and

quantitative aspect of life while hides other aspects of life such as purpose, entertainment etc., at the same time. Life as container metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life as a qualitative and quantitative entity.

Section 3.5 shows that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain music such as*تارونه / **strings**, چې‌رلے / touch/ play, رباب / rabb a musical instrument, اوترنکولے / play, زیرو بم / high & low melody, سندرغاړو / singers, وایي / sing, سازونه / musical compositions, نغمه song, سوز / pathos, ترانه / song, غږيږي / play, پوست / soft, شرنک / musical sound, تال / musical sound* were mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as music is a structural metaphor that highlights the entertainment and creative aspect of life while hides other aspects of life such as quality, quantity and purpose at the same time. Life as music metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life as an entertainment and a thing of joy.

Section 3.6 indicates that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain burden such as *پيټي / burden, په اوږو بار / weight on shoulders, نا توا نا اوږو / weak shoulders, ستر/big/ heavy , درونډ / heavy, لاش / dead body, ستړے ستومانه / tired, بار / weight, گرځوم / carry, واړه / small, را اوچت کړے مے دے / I lifted the [weight], مړے / dead body [weight]*were mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as burden is an ontological metaphor that highlights the difficulties and hopelessness about life while hides other aspects of life such as creativity and entertainment, quality, quantity and purpose eat the same time. Life as burden metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life as a hopeless event.

Section 3.7 exhibits that the vocabulary pertaining to source domain gamble such as*بانډي‌للل / lost, تاوان / lose, په داؤ لګولي شوے /put at stake, چال /move / trick , يکه /trump card , چال باز /trickster , خوانی) / youth, مازغهٔ / mind / brain, دين / religion, ايمان / faith, peace/، جانان,سکون او اطمينان / beloved as metaphorical wealth and assets) , جوارګر / gambler, زر / gold/ wealth, مال / wealth, اوګټو / win, ځان / self , ارزان / cheap* were mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as gamble is a structural metaphor that highlights risk aspect of life while hides other aspects of life such as creativity and entertainment, quality, quantity, challenge, hopelessness and purpose at the same time. Life as gamble metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life as an event that includes high risks.

The vocabulary pertaining to source domain trial such as *خدائے ته حاضر وی / appear before God, فيصله / verdict / decision, اوروی / announce, جواب / plead, خلاصی / released, سبب / reason, ګواهي / witness, اندامونه / body parts [metaphorically as people],* were mapped onto target domain life. Moreover, the conceptual metaphor life as trial is a structural metaphor that highlights the moral judgment and justice aspect about life while hides other

aspects of life such as creativity and entertainment, quality, quantity, high-risk event at the same time. Life as trial metaphor shows that Pashtuns understand life as an activity based on retributive justice.

Sections 3.1 to 3.8 indicates that life is understood as food, journey, person, container, music, burden, gamble and trial in the Pashto language and culture because the lexicon pertaining to these source domains are used to talk about life rather than these domains. Each mapping in all sections is a single instance of the conceptual metaphor life as food, journey, person, container, music, burden, gamble and trial respectively. The knowledge of Pashtuns about these source domains is explicit and detailed as compared to life because these domains are concrete repetitive bodily experience in Pashtun culture that gets a structure in the mind through persistent recurrence.

Looking at the importance of Pashto language, Pashto linguistics has yet to look outside traditional Aristotelian view of metaphor and encounter the conceptual metaphor theory. This study applies conceptual metaphor theory on Pashto language for the first time and breaks the ground by identifying, analyzing and establishing conceptual metaphors for life in Pashto. Further, by demonstrating conceptual metaphors for life in Pashto speech community, this study shall also contribute to a body of literature that collectively demonstrates that Metaphor is inherent in human conceptual system, reasoning and speech. Furthermore, it shall pave way for upcoming research scholars to conduct research on various conceptual metaphors such as love, happiness, peace, anger, fear, time, cause, self, mind, sacrifice, violence, death, State etc. Moreover, it shall open a window to apply CMT in various academic fields such as English language teaching, discourse analysis, political studies and peace and conflict studies in Pashto speech community

Bibliography

Bangash, Roshan.چونګ له خروارہ (Trans. Selection from a Large Quantity), 1st, 2nd, 3rdEdition, Peshawar: University Publishers Qissa Khwani, 2014.

Durani, Muflis. صحا فت با با حاجي ګل کرم (Trans. The Father of Pashto Journalism)"In *پښتون (Pukhtoon Magazine), 4(3),* Peshawar: Bacha Khan Trust, 2009.

Khan, Imran.*Conceptual Metaphors for Life in English and Pashto.* Unpublished M. Phil. Thesis, Area Study Centre Russia, China, Central Asia & Afghanistan, University of Peshawar, 2017.

Kovecses, Zoltan.*Metaphor: A practical introduction*. Oxford University Press, 2010.

Lakoff, George, and Johnson, Mark. *Metaphors We Live By*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1980.

Lakoff, George."The Contemporary Theory of Metaphor". In Otorny, A. (Ed.) *Metaphor and Thought*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Qais, Inam Ullah Jan. *زړۀ کۀ دماغ (Trans. Heart or Brain).* Peshawar: University Book Agency, 1999.

Rahman, Tariq. "Pashto Language & Identity Formation in Pakistan."*Contemporary South Asia* (4)2, 1995.

Raz, Salim. *زۀ لمحه لمحه قتليږم* (Trans./Being Killed Every Moment).Peshawar: Master Printers, JangiMohalla, 2009.

Yousafzay,Farhad Ali Wasim. *د متلونو په لار* (Trans. On the Path of Proverbs). Peshawar: Aamir Print and Publishers, 2014.

*پښتو (اتم جماعت د پاره)*Pashto Text Book for Class 8th. Peshawar: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Text Book Board, 2017.

لټون: د غني کليا ت، نوي کلام (Trans. Anthology of Ghani Khan's Poetry). 4th Edition. Peshawar: University Book Agency, 2012.

Internet Sources

Ezzat..*زوجينو حقوقد ښځي او خاوند*(Trans. Rights of husband and wife). 2011, http://www.quranawsunnat.com/?p=3109 Retrieved on 20/4/ 2014.

Khyber News, کراچی جلسه پی ټی ائی اواپم کې‌واپم مک مکا وه: سعد رفیق (Trans. Karachi Public Gathering was PTI's Deal with MQM) http://www.khybernews.tv/pashto/newsDetails.php?cat=19&key=NjU5Mjg= Retrieved on 125/1/2017

Mafton, Ikram Uddin.هرکلی دار ته (Trans. Welcoming Death) https://incubator.wikimedia.org/wiki/Wb/ps/%D8%AF%D8%A7%D8%B1_%D8%AA%D9%87_%D9%87%D8%B1%DA%A9%D9%84%DB%8C Retrieved on 25/1/2018

Nasiri.*انتخابات کۀ شاتو کې زهر*(Trans; Elections or Poisoned honey) http://www.benawa.com/pashto/print.php?id=24014 Retried 22/1/2018

Central Asia Journal No. 81, Winter 2017

CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY (CSR) AMONG THE MANAGERS OF FLOUR MILLS INDUSTRY IN KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA- PAKISTAN: THEORY AND PRACTICE

Pervez Akhtar [*] ***& Shahid Khan Kakakhel*** [Ψ]

Abstract

The core aim of the study is to explore the know-how and practice about Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) among the managers of Flour Mills Industry of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Primary data has been collected from a sample of 21 Flour Mills in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through interview technique. The study adopts qualitative approach for investigating the problem. The results show that the management of the industry has somewhat understanding of the concept of CSR. In addition, they demonstrated assertive behavior for executing CSR. However, due to little know-how about CSR on the part of managers, its execution and implementation have not been carried out in an effective and fruitful way. Arranging training for firms employees on CSR, establishing a CSR Unit in the Govt. Industries department for making CSR policies and coordinating with the firms and government legislation for practicing CSR are some of the recommendations of the study.

Key Words: Corporate Social Responsibility, Know-how, Management attitudes and behaviors, Flour mills industry, ethical responsibility of firms, stakeholders

Introduction

Corporate social responsibility refers to efforts of the firms taken towards well being of different stakeholders of the society. This concept implies that

[*] Ph.D. Research Scholar, Department of Management Sciences, Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, D.I. Khan

[Ψ] Associate Professor, Department of Management Sciences, Islamia College University, Peshawar

firms have to pay back to the society in terms of its welfare because they run and earn their businesses from these stakeholders. The concept of taking care of needs of the society has always existed in Islam and is being practiced in the businesses but is less formal. However, it got popularity in 1930s. CSR is the management of the business procedures for welfare of the society.[1] It has been observed that taking care of the stakeholder's concerns is the moral obligation of the businesses.[2] Carroll's model of social responsibility provides a hierarchy of responsibilities just like Ibrahim Maslow's hierarchy of needs for motivation.

Researchers have made attempts to define the concept in different ways. CSR refers to a company's activities demonstrating the inclusion of social and environmental concerns in business operations.[3] The investment in CSR has been attributed to the establishment of a beneficial relationship with customers and other primary stakeholders.[4] The concept though popular in west yet CSR is getting importance in the developing nations.[5] In this way globally CSR phenomena are being led by Europe and North America.[6]

This study focused on the level of understanding of the managers in the Flour Mills industry and their attitudes towards CSR practices. The proper understanding of the concept will develop a positive attitude and will result into more effective implementation of the corporate social responsibility.

Research Objectives

i) Assessing the understanding of CSR practices among the managers and

ii) Assessing the attitudes of the managers towards CSR phenomena in the Flour Mills industry of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

---

[1] Jopseph Baker, "Corporate Social Responsibility." *L'Économie politique*, (2), (2003), 105-112.

[2] Lex Donaldson and James H. Davis, "Stewardship theory or agency theory: CEO governance and shareholder returns." *Australian Journal of management*, 16(1), (1991), 49-64.

[3] Vitor Marcel, "Concepts and Definitions of CSR and Corporate Sustainability: Between Agency and Communion." *Journal of business ethics*, *44*(2-3), (2003), 95-105

[4] John Peloza and Jingzhi Shang, "How can corporate social responsibility activities create value for stakeholders? A systematic review." *Journal of the academy of Marketing Science*, *39*(1), (2011), 117-135

[5] Dima Jamali, "A stakeholder approach to corporate social responsibility: A fresh perspective into theory and practice." *Journal of business ethics*, *82*(1), (2008), 213-231

[6] Micheal Blowfield and George Frynas, "Editorial Setting new agendas: critical perspectives on Corporate Social Responsibility in the developing world." *International affairs*, *81*(3), (2005), 499-513

Literature Review

CSR Programs can create strategic edge for the organizations and this included awareness of benefits of both the firms and its stakeholders including its employees.[7] Similarly, on the benefits of CSR in Record Management Industry (Leveraging the Benefits of CSR in the Records Management Industry) it was concluded that CSR is simply the aligning of the business practices to the needs of all the stakeholders, employees and customers. CSR has moved from ideology to reality, and many consider it necessary for organizations to define their roles in the society and apply social and ethical standards for their businesses.[8]

There is an increasing recognition of the potential contribution of Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) towards employment and economic growth in Pakistan.[9] SMEs have been identified and universally accepted as the major contributory factor towards the job creation and poverty alleviation in developing countries, given their labor-intensive production processes and significant employment growth rates.[10] SMEs contributions for the society however differ from the multinational organizations on the basis of scope[11] as the SMEs are limited to work in their local markets on a smaller scale.[12]

Four major stakeholder groups have been identified in the developing

---

[7] William B. Werther, Jr and David Chandler, "Strategic corporate social responsibility: Stakeholders in a global environment." *Sage publications Business & Economics*, (April 2008), 415

[8] Adam Lindgreen, Valerie Swaen and Timothy T. Campbell, "Corporate social responsibility practices in developing and transitional countries: Botswana and Malawi." *Journal of Business Ethics, 90*(3), (2009), 429-440

[9] Muhammad Khurram S. Bhutta, Jamshed S. Khan, Adnan Omar and Usman Asad, "An exploratory study of the characteristics affecting the success of SMEs in Pakistan." *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business, 7*(1), (2009),107-122

[10] Jan de Kok, Claudia Deijil and Christi Veldhuris-Van Essen, *"Is small still beautiful? Literature review of recent empirical evidence on the contribution of SMEs to employment creation."* Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH, (April 2013).

[11] David Murrilo and Joseph M. Lozzano, "SMEs and CSR: An approach to CSR in their own words." *Journal of Business Ethics, 67*(3), (2006), 227-240

[12] Antonio Tencati and Angelne Russo, "Formal vs. informal CSR strategies: Evidence from Italian micro, small, medium-sized, and large firms." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 85(2), (2009), 339-353

economies as major contributing factors like "development agencies"[13] "trade unions"[14], "INGOs", and "business associations". Apart from that media has also emerged as another important factor for mobilizing the firms to practice CSR.

It was observed that most of the firms in Pakistan are mainly involved in philanthropy and charity activities for the benefits of the society.[15] On the other hand, CSR is slowly and gradually taking place in the corporations in the Telecom industry of Pakistan.[16] Moreover, CSR is being practiced in Pakistan on a moderate level.[17]

Methods and Procedures of Research

The study was descriptive and qualitative. Descriptive studies are more useful for detail study of qualitative phenomena.[18]

All the 100 working Flour Mills in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa formed the population. A sample of 21 firms from the population was selected randomly and studied through administering pre-structured questionnaires to the management. The questionnaire consisted of both open and close ended questions.

Data analysis

The collected data was analyzed through a three-stage process model given by Miles and Huberman.[19] The stages were a) data reduction, b) data display, and c) drawing of conclusion and recommendations.

---

[13] Rhys Jenikas," Globalization, corporate social responsibility and poverty." *International affairs*, 81(3), (2005), (525-540

[14] Allans S. Kaufman," Kaufman brief intelligence test." *John Wiley & Sons, Inc*..(February 2014). Retrieved from https://doi/10.1002/9781118660584.ese1325, accessed on 11/11/2017

[15] Peter Lund-Thomsen, Adam Lindgreen, and Joelle Vanhamme," Industrial Clusters and CSR in developing countires: What we know, what we don't know, and what we need to know." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 133(1), (2016), 9-24.

[16] Roma Afridi, Amna Mahmood, Madiha Riaz and Shahbaz Ali, "CSR in Pakistan Telecom Industry." (December 2008). Retrieved from http://www. Scribed.com/doc/34563551, accessed on 02/12/2017

[17] Waqas Awan, Yasir Kamal, Muhammad Rafique and Shahbaz Khan, "CSR in Pakistan economy." (April 2012). Retrieved from DOI:10.22549/BER/4.1.1, accessed on 12/12/2017.

[18] Leonard Bickman and Debra J. Rog, *The Sage handbook of applied social research methods, ed.2.* (Amazon.com, 1998), 161

[19] Mathew B. Miles, Michael Huberman and Johnny Saldana, *Qualitative data analysis: A Methods Sourcebook, ed. 3.* (Amazon.com, 1994), 408

Results and theoretical implications

I. Individual Cases Review

Figure 1 lists the main research questions, their corresponding interview questions and the outcomes of the respective research questions.

The Flour Mills included in the study had big investments ranging from Rs. 40 million to Rs. 100 million. They employed 10-15 employees on average in a flour mill. Most of the employees were either ad-hoc or daily wage employees. Some sections of employees were permanently employed. Most of the companies were doing their businesses for the last two decades. Data was collected from the top Management of the mills.

Summary of Responses on the Research Questions

a) Understanding/Knowledge of CSR

Majority of the firms didn't have any idea of the concept, though; they were performing CSR in one or in the other way informally. Some of the firms, on the other hand, had some idea of the concept. They defined it as "help of the society, social welfare, providing relief to humanity, and the employees' welfare". The firms that could explain the important obligations to the society in addition to serving the owners were providing safe and healthy (quality) product to the people, keeping the firms' environment clean and well being of the society on priority. Most of the managers agreed that the firms' should be profitable first in order to have an ease, more funds and space to practice CSR.

b) Attitude towards CSR

Most of the firms had a positive attitude towards CSR practices by the businesses. They agreed that firms need to be doing charity work. Few firms' management was of the view that earning business should be the first priority of the firms. However, most of the firms didn't know the reasons for the firms to practice CSR. Some said that firms practice CSR because it is their duty; some stated that they practice CSR for their image improvement and some stated that firms practice CSR to earn more profit.

Summary of Individual Cases

The individual case studies gave a useful input regarding the background of each of the firms in the Flour Mills Industry in the interviews and their responses to the two research questions developed from the literature review.

Starting from the introduction of the industry, information on the understanding and knowledge of the CSR of the managers represented their level of familiarity with the concept, which is essential if someone is going to implement a strategy on a concept. Similarly, information on their attitude towards CSR reflected the direction of what type of liking or disliking they had of the CSR phenomena.

The next section deals with the identification of similarities or difference arising out of these individual cases in response to each of the two research questions and their outcomes.

II. Cross-Case Data Analysis by Research

The review of the individual cases rendered a summary of understanding of each of the firm in the Flour Mills Industry of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. This analysis thus provided a foundation for undertaking a cross-case data analysis to derive the emerging themes and further explore them in depth.

Findings with respect to Research Questions

There were six interview questions under the Research Question 1. Interview Questions 1 and 2 asked the interviewees to identify their familiarity with the concept of CSR and how did they define the important components of CSR or in other words what are their main obligations under the term CSR? The Interview Question 3, 4 and 5 were regarding their understanding of obligations for their employees under CSR. Interview Question 6 asked the employees regarding their understanding of financial strength for practicing CSR. All these questions aimed at developing an understanding of the basic knowledge of the management of the firms regarding CSR and especially what specific obligations they define for their businesses to society under the said concept? The major findings with respect to each interview questions are given below:

a) Findings with respect to Interview Q 1 & 2:

Finding 1.1: The Management of Flour Mills Industry does not have proper understanding of CSR.

Finding 1.2: 'Employees' welfare', 'provision of quality product' and 'supporting charity' are the top three main obligations of the firms towards the society.

Finding 1.3: The CSR activities are mostly individually centered and have small scale impact.

b) Findings with respect to Interview Q 3, 4 & 5:

Finding 1.4: Spending on employees is expense for the firms.

Finding 1.5: Type of employment varies according to the nature of the businesses.

Finding 1.6: Seasonal businesses have contractual employees.

c) Findings with respect to Interview Q 6:

Finding 1.7: Firms need to be profitable first to practice CSR

d) Summary of findings from RQ1:

The understanding of the CSR in the firms in the Flour Mills in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa is not very sound. Technically the Management of the firms is not much conversant with the CSR concept though they practice and take part in social welfare in one or the other way. This situation of lack of proper understanding of the CSR concept prevents them to utilize the subject more effectively for the benefit of the society and the business. The employees' welfare is on top of the obligations of the firms in the sector since the firms have limited interactions with the society. Other important considerations in CSR are product's quality and supporting the society welfare programs at a small level like donations and charity. The firms know that they need to have profits/enough funds to enable them to practice CSR more effectively. Since, the CSR activities are mainly centered on individual's welfare (employees or charity) therefore the effect of these CSR efforts on the overall welfare of the society is low. Figure 2 summarizes the findings from Research question 1.

Research Question 2: What is the Managers' attitude towards CSR?

Aim of this Research Question was to know the inclination of the Management of the firms in the Flour Mills towards the concept of CSR. Simply intended to identify the mood of the management towards CSR whether they support CSR phenomena or otherwise? This Research Question consisted of 04 interview questions (IQ7-IQ10). The Interview Question 7 intended to know whether the management supports the firms to do CSR or not? The Interview Question 8 was asked to know the management's opinion regarding the trend i.e. increase or decrease of emphasis on the CSR in their particular area/market. Interview Questions 9

and 10 investigated to know the main reasons/motivations behind practicing of CSR and not practicing of CSR by the firms.

(a) Findings with respect to Interview Questions 7 and 8:

Finding 2.1: Firms support practicing part in the charity from the very outset

Finding 2.2: There is a very slow growth regarding increase of emphasis

(b) Findings with respect to Interview Question 9 & 10:

Finding 2.3: 'Ethical considerations' and 'improvement of image' are the main two reasons for practicing of CSR by the firms

Finding 2.4: Firms are reluctant to practice CSR because they are unaware of the CSR concept

c) Summary of findings from RQ2:

The management of most of the firms was of the view that the firms should traditionally be taking part in the CSR activities. However, they were indifferent about the fact that emphases on CSR in the firms are increasing in specific area. However, they were optimistic that there is a slow increase in the growth of CSR activities in most of the firms. The main motivations behind practicing CSR cited by the managers were that they practice CSR because it is their ethical responsibility and they intent to project their positive image in the society through taking part in the social welfare. Lack of awareness of the firms regarding the benefits of CSR was regarded as the major factor for not practicing of CSR. Figure 3 summarizes the findings for Research Question 2.

Recommendations

1) Managers do practice CSR but do not have clear concept of CSR, they need to be trained in CSR in order to be more effective in doing CSR.

2) Firms' mainly focus on employees in their CSR and need to take care of the society's interests as a whole.

3) Most of the employment offered by the firms is contractual/seasonal; they need to provide job security to the employees for their professional development and raising of their life standards.

4) Govt. needs to play its role in educating the firms' management in CSR, one recommendation will be to arrange training programs in CSR for management of the firms and second recommendation is by establishing a

permanent CSR Unit in the Govt. Industries department for making CSR policies and coordinating with the firms.

5) Firms have positive attitude towards CSR, there is a need to take benefit of this opportunity for furthering the CSR concept for the overall benefits of the society.

6) Firms believe practicing CSR is their ethical responsibility, so volunteer CSR needs to be further encouraged.

7) Firms need to be educated on the concept that if they practice CSR, it will lead to a prosperous society, which in turn will benefit the businesses.

8) Firms need to spend more on employees' development as happy and contented workforce is more productive.

9) The role of the government is essential in promoting the CSR concept among firms which already have positive attitude in this regard to speed up the role of businesses in the development of the society.

Future Research Directions & Implications

This research raises the opportunity of more analytical research in the area/CSR in the different geographical locations, environments and different types of industries. As there is a limited research on CSR and stakeholders' management as compared to its increasing importance in this part of the world, this research opens avenues for research especially in the big industries like Flour Mills sector which involves huge investments and have more potential to contribute to the society. Another area for future research is to study the role of the government in formalizing the CSR and stakeholder management strategies in the firms. Currently the role of the government in CSR is inactive and more proactive role of the government can help CSR to be more useful for the society.

Conclusion

This research addressed the research problem related to the understanding of the concept of CSR and the attitude of the managers towards CSR in the Flour Mills industry of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. The firms' Management did not have proper understanding of CSR. The managers defined CSR in terms of their obligations towards their employees, providing quality product to the customers and welfare of the society. The management seemed to be informed by the CSR concept though defined in

different ways and meanings by the management of different firms but they had a vague idea of the CSR. However, they had a positive attitude towards the CSR concept and supported the charity and support activities of the society by the firms. In their CSR practices, however, major attention was given to employees' welfare. Most of the firms regarded practicing of CSR as their ethical responsibility. Second important reason cited for practicing of CSR was to build and retain their good image in the society, in order to earn their business viz a viz their competitors in the society. The main reason for low impact on the society's welfare of their CSR activities was the lack of understanding of the concept of CSR.

In conclusion, it is said that by and large CSR is practiced in most of the Flour Mills in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa-Pakistan but these efforts are mostly informal. The main reasons for this informal CSR is the lack of awareness of the management of the firms regarding the CSR concept, lack of training in CSR and lack of patronage of the Government in CSR. The Government and the management of the firms can jointly play a major role in regularizing, registering and recording the CSR efforts in Khyber Pakhutnkhwa, Pakistan. Once CSR established in the Government Sector and the private sector firms then it can be a very useful activity for the benefits of the government, the firms and the society.

Research Questions (RQ)	**Interview Questions (IQ)**	**Outcomes**
RQ1. What is the understanding of Managers about CSR in Food, Beverage and Tobacco Sector of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa?	IQ 1. Are you familiar with the concept of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)? If Yes, What is it? IQ 2. Do you think that organizations have some obligations towards society in addition to serving the owners? If Yes, what are these? IQ 3. In your opinion, is spending on organizational employees a cost or revenue for the business/organization? If cost how? And if revenue how? IQ 4. What type of employment does your organization offer to its employees? Permanent, contract, daily wages IQ 5. Does your organization offer any post-pensionary	a)Understanding /knowledge of CSR

	benefits to its employees? If yes, what are these benefits? IQ 6. Do you think it is essential for a business to be profitable first to practice CSR? If yes Why? If No, Why?	
RQ2. What is the Managers' attitude towards CSR?	IQ 7. Do you agree that organizations should traditionally be taking part in charity activities? IQ 8. Do you believe that emphases on CSR are increasing in this part of the world now-a-days? IQ 9. What do you think is the main reason for organizations to practice CSR? Improve image, because it is their duty, to earn profit, any other reason IQ 10. Why do you think Management is reluctant to invest in CSR?	b) Attitude towards CSR

Figure 1 (Questions and Outcomes)

Finding 1.1	The Management of Flour Mills Industry does not have proper understanding of CSR
Finding 1.2	'Employees' welfare', 'provision of quality product' and 'supporting charity' are the top three main obligations of the firms towards the society
Finding 1.3	The CSR activities are mostly individual centered and have little impact on the overall development of the society
Finding 1.4	Spending on employees is expense for the firms
Finding 1.5	Type of employment varies according to the nature of the

	businesses
Finding 1.6	Seasonal businesses have contractual employees
Finding 1.7	Firms need to be profitable first to practice CSR

Figure 2. Findings from Research Question 1

Finding 2.1	Firms support practicing part in the charity from the very outset
Finding 2.2	There is a very slow growth regarding increase of emphasis
Finding 2.3	'Ethical considerations' and 'improvement of image' are the main two reasons for practicing of CSR by the firms
Finding 2.4	Firms are reluctant to practice CSR because they are unaware of the CSR concept

Figure 3. Findings from Research Question 2

Bibliography

Afridi, Roma, Mahmood, Amna, Riaz, Madiha and Ali, Madiha. "CSR in Pakistan Telecom Industry." (December 2008). Retrieved from http://www. Scribed.com/doc/34563551, accessed on 02/12/2017.

Awan, Waqas, Kamal, Yasir, Rafique, Muhammad and Khan, Shahbaz. "CSR in Pakistan economy." (April 2012). Retrieved from DOI:10.22549/BER/4.1.1, accessed on 12/12/2017.

Baker, Jopseph. "Corporate Social Responsibility." *L'Économie politique*, (2), 2003.

Bhutta, Muhammad Khurram S. Khan, Jamshed S. Omar, Adnan and Asad, Usman. "An exploratory study of the characteristics affecting the success of SMEs in Pakistan." *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, *7*(1), 2009.

Bickman, Leonard and Rog, Debra J. *The Sage handbook of applied social research methods, ed.2.* Amazon.com, 1998.

Blowfield, Micheal and Frynas, George. "Editorial Setting new agendas: critical perspectives on Corporate Social Responsibility in the developing world." *International affairs*, *81*(3), 2005.

Donaldson, Lex and Davis, H. James. "Stewardship theory or agency theory: CEO governance and shareholder returns." *Australian Journal of management*, 16(1), 1991.

Jamali, Dima. "A stakeholder approach to corporate social responsibility: A fresh perspective into theory and practice." *Journal of business ethics*, *82*(1), 2008.

Jenikas, Rhys ." Globalization, corporate social responsibility and poverty." *International affairs*, 81(3), 2005.

Kaufman, Allans S." Kaufman brief intelligence test." *John Wiley & Sons, Inc*..(February 2014). Retrieved from https://doi/10.1002/9781118660584.ese1325, accessed on 11/11/2017.

Kok, Jan de, Deijil, Claudia and Essen, Christi Veldhuris-Van. *"Is small still beautiful? Literature review of recent empirical evidence on the contribution of SMEs to employment creation."* Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH, April 2013.

Lindgreen, Adam, Swaen, Valerie and Campbell, Timothy T. "Corporate social responsibility practices in developing and transitional countries: Botswana and Malawi." *Journal of Business Ethics*, *90*(3), 2009.

Lund-Thomsen, Peter, Lindgreen, Adam and Vanhamme, Joelle. " Industrial Clusters and CSR in developing countires: What we know, what we don't know, and what we need to know." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 133(1), 2016.

Marcel, Vitor "Concepts and Definitions of CSR and Corporate Sustainability: Between Agency and Communion." *Journal of business ethics*, *44*(2-3), 2003.

Miles, Mathew B., Huberman, Michael and Saldana, Johnny. *Qualitative data analysis: A Methods Sourcebook, ed. 3.* Amazon.com, 1994.

Murrilo, David and Lozzano, Joseph M. "SMEs and CSR: An approach to CSR in their own words." *Journal of Business Ethics*, *67*(3), 2006.

Peloza, John and Shang, Jingzhi. "How can corporate social responsibility activities create value for stakeholders? A systematic review." *Journal of the academy of Marketing Science*, *39*(1), 2011.

Tencati, Antonio and Russo, Angelne. "Formal vs. informal CSR strategies: Evidence from Italian micro, small, medium-sized, and large firms." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 85(2), 2009.

Werther, William B. Jr and Chandler, David. "Strategic corporate social responsibility: Stakeholders in a global environment." *Sage publications Business & Economics*, April 2008.